

For full information on books and academic journal articles, cited here by last name(s) and date only, see the References section. These notes are available at

TheCoddling.com, to make it easy for readers to access the many online resources listed.

Epigraph

1. In Byrom (1993), chapter 3, verses 40–43. The more literal rendering in Mascaro (1973), chapter 3, verses 42–43, has the same meaning but is not as elegant: “An enemy can hurt an enemy, and a man who hates can harm another man, but a man’s own mind, if wrongly directed, can do him a far greater harm. A father or a mother or a relative, can indeed do good to a man; but his own right-directed mind can do to him a far greater good.”
2. Solzhenitsyn (1975), p. 168.

Introduction: The Search for Wisdom

1. Nietzsche (1889/1997). Maxim number 8.
2. Ponos was a minor Greek god of toil, pain, and hardship. Miso means “hatred” (as in “misogyny”), so the ancient Greek word misoponos means a hater of painful toil and hardship. We thank Professor Ian McCready-Flora, specialist in ancient Greek philosophy at the University of Virginia, for guiding us to this name. We cast Misoponos as the oracle of Koalemos. Koalemos is mentioned briefly in Aristophanes’ play *The Birds* as the god of stupidity.
3. For readers outside the United States, let us take a moment here to clarify a few terms and Americanisms. We’ll use the words “college” and “university” more or less interchangeably to refer to what in the United Kingdom and Canada is called “university.” We’ll often refer to “campus” to refer to the grounds, setting, and culture of universities. “High school” refers to grades nine through twelve, roughly ages fourteen to eighteen. We’ll generally avoid using the word “liberal” to refer to the left, as is commonly done in the USA; we’ll speak of left and right, progressive and conservative.
4. Find out more at <http://www.theFIRE.org>
5. Jarvie, J. (2014, March 3). Trigger happy. *The New Republic*. Retrieved from <https://newrepublic.com/article/116842/trigger-warnings-have-spread-blogs-college-classes-thats-bad>
6. Medina, J. (2014, May 17). Warning: The Literary Canon Could Make Students Squirm. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2014/05/18/us/warning-the-literary-canon-could-make-students-squirm.html>
7. Columbia College. (n.d.). The Core curriculum: Literature Humanities. Retrieved from <https://www.college.columbia.edu/core/lithum>
8. Johnson, K., Lynch, T., Monroe, E., & Wang, T. (2015, April 30). Our identities matter in Core classrooms. *Columbia Daily Spectator*. Retrieved from <https://www.columbiaspectator.com/opinion/2015/04/30/our-identities-matter-core-classrooms/>
9. The “canon wars” that erupted after the publication of Allan Bloom’s *The Closing of the American Mind* (1987) were mostly fought by faculty, but students often sided with the faculty

favoring the inclusion of more women and people of color. For example, in a 1987 rally at Stanford celebrating such diversification, students chanted, “Hey hey, ho ho, Western culture’s got to go.” See: Bernstein, R. (1988, January 19). In dispute on bias, Stanford is likely to alter Western culture program. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from

<https://www.nytimes.com/1988/01/19/us/in-dispute-on-bias-stanford-is-likely-to-alter-western-culture-program.html>

10. Pinker (2016), p. 110.

11. Haidt (2006).

12. Nelson, L. (2015, September 14). Obama on liberal college students who want to be “coddled”: “That’s not the way we learn.” *Vox*. Retrieved from

<https://www.vox.com/2015/9/14/9326965/obama-political-correctness>

13. There were hints in the United Kingdom as early as 2014; see O’Neill, B. (2014, November 22). Free speech is so last century. Today’s students want the “right to be comfortable.”

Spectator. Retrieved from <https://www.spectator.co.uk/2014/11/free-speech-is-so-last-century-todays-students-want-the-right-to-be-comfortable>. But the number of news reports about “safe spaces” and related phenomena seemed to increase after the attention they got in the United States in the fall of 2015. See, for example: Gosden, E. (2016, April 3). Student accused of violating university “safe space” by raising her hand. *The Telegraph*. Retrieved from

<https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2016/04/03/student-accused-of-violating-university-safe-space-by-raising-he/>

14. See a summary of research and news reports from several countries at

<https://heterodoxacademy.org/international>

15. There were dozens of cases, among them Eric Garner, Mike Brown, Tamir Rice, and Freddie Gray. It is less well-known that there were also several black women who were victims of police violence, including Michelle Cusseaux, Tanisha Anderson, Aura Rosser, and Meagan Hockaday. For more information on police shootings, see: Kelly, K., et al. (2016, December 30). Fatal shootings by police remain relatively unchanged after two years. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from

https://www.washingtonpost.com/investigations/fatal-shootings-by-police-remain-relatively-unchanged-after-two-years/2016/12/30/fc807596-c3ca-11e6-9578-0054287507db_story.html?utm_term=.48589748a729

16. Dorell, O. (2016, June 29). 2016 already marred by nearly daily terror attacks. *USA Today*.

Retrieved from <https://www.usatoday.com/story/news/world/2016/06/29/major-terrorist-attacks-year/86492692/>

17. Parvini, S., Branson-Potts, H., & Esquivel, P. (2017, February 1). For victims of San Bernardino terrorist attack, conflicting views about Trump policy in their name. *Los Angeles Times*. Retrieved from

<http://www.latimes.com/local/lanow/la-me-san-bernardino-trump-20170131-story.html>

18. Ellis, R., Fantz, A., Karimi, F., & McLaughlin, E. (2016, June 13). Orlando shooting: 49 killed, shooter pledged ISIS allegiance. *CNN*. Retrieved from

<https://www.cnn.com/2016/06/12/us/orlando-nightclub-shooting/index.html>

19. Branch, J., Kovaleski, S, & Tavernise, S. (2017, October 4). Stephen Paddock chased gambling’s payouts and perks. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from

<https://www.nytimes.com/2017/10/04/us/stephen-paddock-gambling.html>. See also: AP. (2018, January 19). The latest: Timeline offers look at Vegas shooter’s moves. *U.S. News & World Report*. Retrieved from

<https://www.usnews.com/news/us/articles/2018-01-19/the-latest-no-motive-uncovered-for-las-vegas-mass-shooting>

20. Coddle [Def. 2]. (n.d.). *Merriam-Webster Dictionary (11th ed.)*. Retrieved from <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/coddling>

21. You can find accessible, comprehensive data on these trends at the website humanprogress.org

Chapter 1: The Untruth of Fragility

What Doesn't Kill You Makes You Weaker

1. The Book of Menciuis, in Chan (1963), p. 78.

2. Hendrick, B. (2010, May 14). Peanut allergies in kids on the rise. *WebMD*. Retrieved from <http://www.webmd.com/allergies/news/20100514/peanut-allergies-in-kids-on-the-rise>

3. Du Toit, Katz et al. (2008).

4. Christakis (2008).

5. Du Toit, Roberts et al. (2015).

6. LEAP Study Results. (2015). Retrieved from <http://www.leapstudy.com/leap-study-results>

7. LEAP Study Results. (2015); see n. 6.

8. Chan, S. (2001). Complex adaptive systems. Retrieved from

<http://web.mit.edu/esd.83/www/notebook/Complex%20Adaptive%20Systems.pdf>. See also: Holland (1992).

9. Okada, Kuhn, Feillet, & Bach (2010).

10. Gopnik, A. (2016, August 31). Should we let toddlers play with saws and knives? *The Wall Street Journal*. Retrieved from <http://www.wsj.com/articles/should-we-let-toddlers-play-with-saws-and-knives-1472654945>

11. Taleb (2012), p. 5.

12. Taleb (2012), p. 3.

13. Child Trends Databank. (2016, November). Infant, child, and teen mortality. Retrieved from <https://www.childtrends.org/indicators/infant-child-and-teen-mortality>

14. Gopnik (2016); see n. 10.

15. Office of Equity Concerns. (2014). Support resources for faculty. *Oberlin College & Conservatory* [via Wayback Machine internet Archive]. Retrieved from <http://web.archive.org/web/20131222174936>

16. Haslam (2016).

17. American Psychiatric Association. (n.d.). DSM history. Retrieved from <https://www.psychiatry.org/psychiatrists/practice/dsm/history-of-the-dsm>

18. Friedman, M. J. (2007, January 31). PTSD: National Center for PTSD. *U.S. Department of Veterans Affairs*. Retrieved from <https://www.ptsd.va.gov/professional/ptsd-overview/ptsd-overview.asp>. See also: Haslam_ (2016), p. 6.

19. Bonanno, Westphal, & Mancini (2011).

20. "Most trauma survivors are highly resilient and develop appropriate coping strategies, including the use of social supports, to deal with the aftermath and effects of trauma. Most recover with time, show minimal distress, and function effectively across major life areas and developmental stages." Center for Substance Abuse Treatment (U.S.). (2014). *Trauma-informed care in behavioral health services*, chapter 3, Understanding the impact of trauma. Rockville, MD: Substance Abuse and Mental Health Services Administration (U.S.). Retrieved from <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK207191>

21. Trauma. (n.d.). *SAMHSA-HRSA Center for Integrated Health Solutions*. Retrieved from <https://www.integration.samhsa.gov/clinical-practice/trauma>. Note: This tautological definition of “trauma” uses the reaction to the “experience” as the definition of whether trauma occurred.
22. This is particularly troubling, because if the effect is included in the definition of “trauma,” when a person experiences what has come to be called “post-traumatic growth,” whatever happened will no longer be defined as trauma, no matter how far outside the range of normal experience. This will eliminate the ability for people to experience post-traumatic growth, because if they are not suffering, the original events will not be defined as “traumatic.” See: Collier (2016).
23. Shulevitz, J. (2015, March 21). In college and hiding from scary ideas. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2015/03/22/opinion/sunday/judith-shulevitz-hiding-from-scary-ideas.html>
24. Rape culture. (n.d.). *Oxford Living Dictionaries*. Retrieved from https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/rape_culture
25. McElroy, W. (2015, September 7). Debate with Jessica Valenti on “rape culture.” Retrieved from <https://wendymcelroy.liberty.me/debate-with-jessica-valenti-on-rape-culture>
26. Shulevitz (2015); see n. 23.
27. Around the same time, one student at Brown created a secret free speech Facebook group to engage in civil dialogue. See: Morey, A. (2015, December 28). FIRE Q&A: Reason@Brown’s Christopher Robotham. *FIRE*. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/fire-qa-reasonbrowns-christopher-robotham>. See also: Nordlinger, J. (2015, November 30). Underground at Brown. *National Review*. Retrieved from <http://www.nationalreview.com/article/427713/underground-brown-jay-nordlinger>
28. This is a perfect example of what former Yale professor William Deresiewicz criticizes as the tendency for elite liberal arts colleges to avoid complex and challenging conversations about issues in favor of dogmatic conversations that create orthodox consensus. See: Deresiewicz, W. (2017, March 6). On political correctness. *The American Scholar*. Retrieved from <https://theamericanscholar.org/on-political-correctness>
29. Shulevitz (2015); see n. 23.
30. For a summary of this work, see: Haidt (2006), chapter 7. See also: work by Lawrence Calhoun & Richard Tedeschi. Posttraumatic Growth Research Group, UNC Charlotte. (n.d.). Retrieved from <https://ptgi.uncc.edu>
31. Foa & Kozak (1986).
32. McNally, R. (2016, September 13). If you need a trigger warning, you need PTSD. treatment. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/roomfordebate/2016/09/13/do-trigger-warnings-work/if-you-need-a-trigger-warning-you-need-ptsd-treatment>
33. R. Leahy (personal communication, December 29, 2017). See also: McNally (2016); see n. 32.
34. So said Aristotle in *The Nicomachean Ethics*. The only exception to this principle we can think of is wisdom.
35. Twenge (2017), p. 3.
36. Twenge (2017), p. 154.
37. For discussion and evidence about the changing dynamic around speech and censorship on college campuses, see Stevens, S., & Haidt, J. (2018, April 11). The skeptics are wrong part 2: Speech culture on campus is changing. Retrieved from <https://heterodoxacademy.org/the-skeptics-are-wrong-part-2>

Chapter 2: The Untruth of Emotional Reasoning Always Trust Your Feelings

1. From the *Enchiridion*. Epictetus & Lebell (1st–2nd century/1995), p. 7.
2. Mascaro (1995), chapter 1, verse 1.
3. Shakespeare, W. *Hamlet*. II.ii, ll. 268–270.
4. Milton (1667/2017), bk. I, ll. 241–255.
5. Boethius (ca. 524 CE/2011). Note that the psychoanalyst Victor Frankl, reflecting on his years in a concentration camp, reached the same conclusion: “Everything can be taken from a man but one thing: the last of the human freedoms—to choose one’s attitude in any given set of circumstances, to choose one’s own way.” See: Frankl (1959/2006), Part I, p. 66.
6. In his best-selling book *Thinking Fast and Slow* (Kahneman 2011), Nobel laureate psychologist Daniel Kahneman refers to automatic processes as System 1, which is fast, and controlled processes as System 2, which is slow.
7. Thousands of studies and hundreds of meta-analyses have now examined the effectiveness of CBT for treating depression and anxiety disorders. For a recent and accessible review of the literature, see: Hollon & DeRubeis (in press). We can summarize a common view with this sentence from the website of the United Kingdom’s Royal College of Psychiatrists: CBT “is one of the most effective treatments for conditions where anxiety or depression is the main problem . . . [it is] the most effective psychological treatment for moderate and severe depression, [and] is as effective as antidepressants for many types of depression.”
Blenkiron, P. (2013, July). Cognitive behavioural therapy. *Royal College of Psychiatrists*. Retrieved from <https://www.rcpsych.ac.uk/mentalhealthinformation/therapies/cognitivebehaviouraltherapy.aspx>
8. “Cognitive therapy can be as efficacious as antidepressant medications . . . unlike medication, its benefits persist after treatment ceases . . . cognitive therapy is at least as efficacious and quite possibly longer lasting than alternative approaches [to Generalized Anxiety Disorder].” Hollon & DeRubeis (in press).
9. Blenkiron (2013); see n. 7. See also: CBT outcome studies. (2016, November 25). *Academy of Cognitive Therapy*. Retrieved from <http://www.academyofct.org/page/OutcomeStudies>
10. We make no claim that CBT is more effective for all psychological disorders, but because it is so easy to do and it is the most researched form of psychotherapy, it is often thought of as the gold standard to which other forms of treatment, including drugs, should be compared. See: Butler, Chapman, Forman, & Beck (2006).
11. Nine common cognitive distortions from the list in Robert L. Leahy, Stephen J. F. Holland, & Lata K. McGinn’s book *Treatment Plans and Interventions for Depression and Anxiety Disorders*, 2nd ed. (New York, NY: Guilford Press, 2012).
12. For various definitions of “critical thinking,” see: Defining critical thinking. (n.d.). *The Foundation for Critical Thinking*. Retrieved from <https://www.criticalthinking.org/pages/defining-critical-thinking/766>
13. Sue et al. (2007). The definition quoted is on p. 271. The term was first coined and discussed by Pierce (1970).
14. Unconscious or implicit associations are very real, although the relationships of such associations to discriminatory behavior are complex and are currently being debated by social

- psychologists. See: Rubinstein, Jussim, & Stevens (2018). For a defense of the role of implicit bias in causing discriminatory behavior, see: Greenwald, Banaji, & Nosek (2015).
15. Even when a person interacts with a bigot, CBT can help that person reduce the amount and likelihood of suffering.
 16. Hamid, S. (2018, February 17). Bari Weiss, outrage mobs, and identity politics. *The Atlantic*. Retrieved from <https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2018/02/bari-weiss-immigrants/553550>
 17. Miller, G. (2017, July 18). The neurodiversity case for free speech. *Quillette*. Retrieved from <http://quillette.com/2017/07/18/neurodiversity-case-free-speech>
 18. FIRE. (2017). Bias Response Team Report. [Blog post]. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/first-amendment-library/special-collections/fire-guides/report-on-bias-reporting-systems-2017>
 19. For a review and critique of research on microaggressions, see Lilienfeld (2017).
 20. For example, Heider (1958). One exception to this principle is very young children, who will often judge a well-intentioned act to be wrong if it accidentally causes harm. See: Piaget (1932/1965).
 21. Utt, J. (2013, July 30). Intent vs. impact: Why your intentions don't really matter. *Everyday Feminism*. Retrieved from <https://everydayfeminism.com/2013/07/intentions-dont-really-matter>
 22. Karith created and teaches the C.A.R.E. model (Conscious Empathy, Active Listening, Responsible Reaction, and Environmental Awareness) in her workshops and presentations.
 23. K. Foster (personal communication, February 17, 2018).
 24. Zimmerman, J. (2016, June 16). Two kinds of PC. *Inside Higher Ed*. Retrieved from <https://www.insidehighered.com/views/2016/06/16/examination-two-kinds-political-correctness-essay>
 25. Rotter (1966).
 26. For reviews, see Cobb-Clark (2015).
 27. Buddelmeyer & Powdthavee (2015).
 28. See, for example, the shout-downs of Charles Murray at Middlebury College and Heather Mac Donald at Claremont McKenna College, which we'll describe in chapter 4. FIRE maintains a database of disinvitation attempts: Disinvitation Database. (n.d.). Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/resources/disinvitation-database>
 29. Bauer-Wolf, J. (2017, October 6). Free speech advocate silenced. *Inside Higher Ed*. Retrieved from <https://www.insidehighered.com/news/2017/10/06/william-mary-students-who-shut-down-aclu-event-broke-conduct-code>
 30. About a third of the cases in which the push came from the right originated off campus, and half these cases involved religious organizations objecting to someone speaking about issues related to abortion and contraception. Of disinvitation efforts from the left, fewer than 5% were initiated from off-campus sources. To examine the data yourself, visit <https://www.thefire.org/resources/disinvitation-database>
 31. Yiannopoulos, M. (2016, August 20). Trolls will save the world. *Breitbart*. Retrieved from <http://www.breitbart.com/milo/2016/08/20/trolls-will-save-world>
 32. Stevens, S. (2017, February 7). Campus speaker disinvitations: Recent trends (Part 2 of 2) [Blog post]. Retrieved from <https://heterodoxacademy.org/2017/02/07/campus-speaker-disinvitations-recent-trends-part-2-of-2>
 33. For more analysis of these trends, including a response to critics who claim that surveys show no recent changes in attitudes toward speech on campus, see Stevens, S., & Haidt, J. (2018,

- April 11). The skeptics are wrong part 2: Speech culture on campus is changing. Retrieved from <https://heterodoxacademy.org/the-skeptics-are-wrong-part-2>
34. Naughton, K. (2017, October). Speaking freely—What students think about expression at American colleges. *FIRE*. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/publications/student-attitudes-free-speech-survey>
35. Socrates' fellow citizens ultimately accused him of impiety and of corrupting the youth of Athens. He was convicted by a jury and forced to drink poison. We'd like to think we are better able to tolerate "impiety" today.
36. Venker, S. (2015, October 20). Williams College's "Uncomfortable Learning" speaker series dropped me. Why? *FIRE*. Retrieved from <http://www.foxnews.com/opinion/2015/10/20/williams-college-dropped-me-from-its-uncomfortable-learning-speaker-series-why.html>
37. Paris, F. (2015, October 21). Organizers cancel Venker lecture. *The Williams Record*. Retrieved from <http://williamsrecord.com/2015/10/21/organizers-cancel-venker-lecture>
38. Wood, Z. (2015, October 18). Breaking through a ring of motivated ignorance. *Williams Alternative*. Retrieved from <http://williamsalternative.com/2015/10/breaking-through-a-ring-of-motivated-ignorance-zach-wood>. See also Wood's 2018 TED Talk: Why it's worth listening to people you disagree with. Retrieved from http://www.ted.com/talks/zachary_r_wood_why_it_s_worth_listening_to_people_we_disagree_with
39. Wood (2015); see n. 38.
40. Gray, (2012), p. 86.
41. Falk, A. (2016, February 18). John Derbyshire's scheduled appearance at Williams. *Williams College Office of the President*. Retrieved from <https://president.williams.edu/letters-from-the-president/john-derbyshires-scheduled-appearance-at-williams>

Chapter 3: The Untruth of Us Versus Them Life Is a Battle Between Good People and Evil People

1. Sacks (2015), p. 51.
2. To protect her privacy, we have changed the student's name.
3. Adapted from the definition here: Cisnormativity. (2017). *The Queer Dictionary*. Retrieved from <http://queerdictionary.blogspot.com/2014/09/definition-of-cisnormativity.html>
4. Other than changing the name of the student and swapping in "[dean of students]" for the original "DOS," this was the exact text of the email.
5. You can see her explanation at minute 48 of this video: The CMC Forum (Producer). (2015, November 11). CMCers of color lead protest of lack of support from administration [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://youtu.be/OIB7Vy-lZZ8?t=48m1s>
6. Miller, S. (2015, November 18). VIDEO: CMCers of color lead protest of dean of students, administration. *The Forum*. Retrieved from <http://cmcforum.com/news/11112015-video-cmcers-of-color-protest-dean-of-students-administration>
7. Tidmarsh, K. (2015, November 11). CMC students of color protest for institutional support, call for dean of students to resign. *The Student Life*. Retrieved from <http://tsl.news/news/5265>
8. See the full video at: The CMC Forum (Producer). (2015, November 11). CMCers of color lead protest of lack of support from administration [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://youtu.be/OIB7Vy-lZZ8?t=3s>

9. Tidmarsh, K. (2015, November 11); see n. 7.
10. See that moment at time 41:33 of the video linked in n. 5.
11. We were not able to find any public statement of support, and when we emailed Spellman to ask if she knew of such a statement, she told us that she did not. Spellman, M. (personal communication, February 8, 2018).
12. Watanabe, T., & Rivera, C. (2015, November 13). Amid racial bias protests, Claremont McKenna dean resigns. *Los Angeles Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.latimes.com/local/lanow/la-me-ln-claremont-marches-20151112-story.html>
13. FIRE (2015, October 30). Email from Erika Christakis: “Dressing yourselves,” email to Silliman College (Yale) students on Halloween costumes [Blog post]. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/email-from-erika-christakis-dressing-yourselfes-email-to-silliman-college-yale-students-on-halloween-costumes>
14. FIRE. (2015, October 27). Email from the Intercultural Affairs Committee [Blog post]. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/email-from-intercultural-affairs>. Note that the Intercultural Affairs Committee is part of the dean’s office.
15. Christakis, E. (2016, October 28). My Halloween email led to a campus firestorm—and a troubling lesson about self-censorship. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/my-halloween-email-led-to-a-campus-firestorm--and-a-troubling-lesson-about-self-censorship/2016/10/28/70e55732-9b97-11e6-a0ed-ab0774c1eaa5_story.html. For the email from Erika Christakis, see n. 13.
16. Wilson, R. (2015, October 31). Open letter to Associate Master Christakis. *Down Magazine*. Retrieved from <http://downat Yale.com/post.php?id=430>
17. By an extraordinary coincidence, Greg happened to be on the Yale campus that day and was present at the confrontation. To watch the videos that Greg took of the event, see: Shibley, R. (2015, September 13). New video of last year’s Yale halloween costume confrontation emerges [Blog post]. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/new-video-of-last-years-yale-halloween-costume-confrontation-emerges>
18. Kirchick, J. (2016, September 12). New videos show how Yale betrayed itself by favoring cry-bullies. *Tablet Magazine*. Retrieved from <http://www.tabletmag.com/jewish-news-and-politics/213212/yale-favoring-cry-bullies>
19. FIRE (Producer). (2015, November 7). Yale University students protest Halloween costume email (VIDEO 3). Retrieved from https://youtu.be/9IEFD_JVYd0?t=1m17s
20. On the question of whether the master creates an intellectual space or a home: the master plays a mixed role, partly residential and quasi-parental, partly intellectual. Jon graduated from Yale in 1985 and went to many academic events and talks in the home of the master of Davenport College.
21. President and Yale College dean underscore commitment to a “better Yale.” (2015, November 6). *YaleNews*. Retrieved from <https://news.yale.edu/2015/11/06/president-and-yale-college-dean-underscore-commitment-better-yale>
22. Stanley-Becker, I. (2015, November 13). Minority students at Yale give list of demands to university president. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/grade-point/wp/2015/11/13/minority-students-at-yale-give-list-of-demands-to-university-president>. See also: Next Yale. (2015, November 18). Next Yale demands for the Administration. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/next-yale-demands-for-the-administration>

23. Schick, F. (2015, December 7). Erika Christakis leaves teaching role. *Yale Daily News*. Retrieved from <https://yaledailynews.com/blog/2015/12/07/erika-christakis-to-end-teaching>
24. Physics professor Douglas Stone spearheaded a public letter defending the Christakis that was signed over the course of many weeks by ninety professors, mostly in the sciences and the medical school. See also: Christakis, E. (2016, October 28). My Halloween email led to a campus firestorm—and a troubling lesson about self-censorship. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/my-halloween-email-led-to-a-campus-firestorm-and-a-troubling-lesson-about-self-censorship/2016/10/28/70e55732-9b97-11e6-a0ed-ab0774c1ea5_story.html
25. For Claremont McKenna, see Watanabe, T., & Rivera, C. (2015, November 13). Amid racial protests, Claremont McKenna dean resigns. *Los Angeles Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.latimes.com/local/lanow/la-me-ln-claremont-marches-20151112-story.html>. For Yale, see Stanley-Becker, I. (2015, November 5). A confrontation over race at Yale: Hundreds of students demand answers from the school's first black dean. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/grade-point/wp/2015/11/05/a-confrontation-over-race-at-yale-hundreds-of-students-demand-answers-from-the-schools-first-black-dean>
26. Tajfel (1970).
27. See overall review in Berreby (2005); see Hogg (2016) for a review of social identity theory; see Cikara & Van Bavel (2014) for a review of neuroscience work in this area.
28. Vaughn, Savjani, Cohen, & Eagleman (manuscript under review). For more on this study, see: iqsquared (Producer). (2012, June 22). David Eagleman: What makes us empathetic? IQ2 Talks [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://youtu.be/TDjWryXdVd0?t=7m42s>
29. For a review of this literature, including the debate over whether “group selection” played a role in the human story, over and above individual selection, see Haidt (2012), chapter 9. For a contrary view, see: Pinker, S. (2012, June 18). The false allure of group selection. *Edge*. Retrieved from https://www.edge.org/conversation/steven_pinker-the-false-allure-of-group-selection
30. Chapter 10 of *The Righteous Mind* (Haidt, 2012) describes the “hive switch,” a psychological reflex in which self-interest is turned off and group interest becomes paramount; people lose themselves in the group. People can become tribal without the hive switch getting activated. The hive response is what happens when tribalism is activated intensely, particularly through highly engaging multisensory rituals.
31. This is the third of three basic principles in Jon’s book *The Righteous Mind*.
32. We are using “tribalism” in a way that overstates the degree of closure and conflict of real tribes. For a description of how real tribes often draw from one another’s practices and form alliances to reduce conflict, see Rosen, L. (2018, January 16). A liberal defense of tribalism. *Foreign Policy*. Retrieved from <http://foreignpolicy.com/2018/01/16/a-liberal-defense-of-tribalism-american-politics>
33. To learn more about how the campus trends described in this book are now influencing high schools, and to find resources for high school students who want to find a more open and intellectually diverse culture in college, please visit heterodoxacademy.org/highschool
34. Rauch, J. (2017, November 9). Speaking as a . . . *The New York Review of Books*. Retrieved from <http://www.nybooks.com/articles/2017/11/09/mark-lilla-liberal-speaking>
35. King (1963/1981), p. 52.
36. King (1963/1981), p. 51.
37. Mascaro (1995), p. 2.

38. Bellah (1967).
39. King, M. L. (1963, August 28). “I have a dream . . .” Retrieved from <https://www.archives.gov/files/press/exhibits/dream-speech.pdf>
40. King (1963); see n. 38. You can listen to an audio recording of the speech here: <http://www.americanrhetoric.com/speeches/mlkihaveadream.htm>
41. Most whites at the time did not see it this way. In a Harris poll a few months before he was assassinated, nearly 75% of Americans expressed disapproval of him, although he had been substantially more popular at the time of his 1963 I Have a Dream speech, and he is wildly popular now, with approval levels above 90%. It took time, but the ideas in his 1963 speech changed the country. See Cobb, J. C. (2018, April 4). When Martin Luther King Jr. was killed, he was less popular than Donald Trump is today. *USA Today*. Retrieved from <https://www.usatoday.com/story/opinion/2018/04/04/martin-luther-king-jr-50-years-assassination-donald-trump-disapproval-column/482242002>
42. Pauli Murray College. (n.d.). About Pauli Murray. Retrieved from <https://paulimurray.yalecollege.yale.edu/subpage-2>
43. Murray (1945), p. 24.
44. MainersUnited (Producer). (2012, November 2). Yes on 1: Mainers United for Marriage—Will & Arlene Brewster [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=rizfhtN6UVc>
45. Chapters 2, 3, and 4 of *The Righteous Mind* (Haidt, 2012) provide a literature review in support of this claim.
46. We have quoted the version given in Haji (2011), p. 185.
47. The essay was removed, but screen shots of it can be found here: Coyne, J. (n.d.). Texas college newspaper publishes op-ed calling white DNA an “abomination” [Blog post]. Retrieved from <https://whyevolutionistrue.wordpress.com/2017/11/30/texas-college-newspaper-publishes-op-ed-calling-white-dna-an-abomination>. (The first line is actually a variant of a line from the Bhagavad Gita: “Now I am become white, destroyer of worlds.”)
48. Cohn, A. (2017, December 13). Students, faculty, and administrators launch attack on Texas State University newspaper. *FIRE*. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/students-faculty-and-administrators-launch-attack-on-texas-state-university-newspaper>
49. Defund the racist University Star. (2017, November 30). Retrieved from <https://www.change.org/p/bobcat-liberty-council-defund-the-racist-star>
50. Cervantes, D. (2017, November 28). Editor’s note. *The University Star*. Retrieved from <https://star.txstate.edu/2017/11/28/letter-from-the-editor-3>
51. More details are found in Cohn (2017); see n. 48. See also: Trauth, D. (2017, November 28). Message from the president regarding University Star column. *Texas State University—Office of Media Relations*. Retrieved from http://www.txstate.edu/news/news_releases/news_archive/2017/November-2017/Statement112917.html
52. As Marcuse explained in a postscript to the essay, added in 1968: “The Left has no equal voice, no equal access to the mass media and their public facilities—not because a conspiracy excludes it, but because, in good old capitalist fashion, it does not have the required purchasing power.” Wolff, Moore, & Marcuse (1965/1969), p. 119.
53. Marcuse referred to “official tolerance granted to the Right as well as to the Left, to movements of aggression as well as to movements of peace, to the party of hate as well as to that of humanity.” Wolff, Moore, & Marcuse (1965/1969), p. 85.

54. Wolff, Moore, & Marcuse (1965/1969), p. 109.
55. Wolff, Moore, & Marcuse (1965/1969), pp. 100–101.
56. Wolff, Moore, & Marcuse (1965/1969), p. 110.
57. Columbia Law School. (2011, October 12). Center for Intersectionality and Social Policy Studies established. Retrieved from http://www.law.columbia.edu/media_inquiries/news_events/2011/october2011/Intersectionality
58. Crenshaw (1989).
59. *Degraffenreid v. General Motors Assembly Division*, 413 F. Supp. 142 (E.D. Mo. 1976).
60. Collins & Bilge (2016), p. 7.
61. TED (Producer). (2016, October). The urgency of intersectionality [Video file]. Retrieved from https://www.ted.com/talks/kimberle_crenshaw_the_urgency_of_intersectionality
62. Morgan (1996), p. 107.
63. Morgan (1996), p. 106.
64. Morgan (1996), p. 106.
65. A video of the encounter is embedded in the documentary *Silence U*, which is available here (the scene begins at time 7:53): We the Internet (Producer). (2016, July 14). *Silence U: Is the university killing free speech and open debate? We the Internet Documentary* [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://youtu.be/x5uaVFfX3AQ?t=7m55s>
66. TED (2016); see n. 61.
67. For example, Creighton University posts on its website an exercise that is “designed to bring a group to certain conclusions regarding the concept of privilege and disadvantage.” Based on various questions, people either step forward or step backward. It begins: “Few White people in the history of the U.S. have ever been convicted and executed for killing a person of color. All White persons take a step forward.” Next: “The high school dropout rate for Latinos, Native Americans and African Americans is over 55%. Latinos, African Americans, and Native Americans take one step back.” At the end of the exercise, whoever is at the front of the room has the most “privilege,” and whoever is at the back has the least. The instructor then says, “Notice what groups of people are in the front and what groups of people are in the back.” See: Privilege exercise (race focus). (n.d.). Retrieved from <https://people.creighton.edu/~idc24708/Genes/Diversity/Privilege%20Exercise.htm>
68. We do not know if ideas related to intersectionality were included in CMC’s orientation process; the ideas may have come from their courses or from other students. But intersectional language is common in the video of the confrontation with Spellman: *The CMC Forum* (Producer) (2015, November 11). CMCers of color lead protest of lack of support from administration [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=O1B7Vy-lZZ8>
69. Friedersdorf, C. (2017, May 8). The destructiveness of call-out culture on campus. *The Atlantic*. Retrieved from <https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2017/05/call-out-culture-is-stressing-out-college-students/524679>
70. Barrett, K. (2016, September 22). Walking on eggshells—How political correctness is changing the campus dynamic. *The Sophian*. Retrieved from <http://www.thesmithsophian.com/walking-on-eggshells-how-political-correctness-is-changing-the-campus-dynamic>
71. For extensive analyses of survey data showing that the campus dynamic related to speech has changed in the last few years, see Stevens, S., & Haidt, J. (2018, April 11), *The skeptics are wrong part 2: Speech culture on campus is changing*. Retrieved from <https://heterodoxacademy.org/the-skeptics-are-wrong-part-2>

72. Friedersdorf (2017); see n. 69.
73. Zimbardo (2007).
74. Eady, T. (2014, November 24). "Everything is problematic": My journey into the centre of a dark political world, and how I escaped. *The McGill Daily*. Retrieved from <https://www.mcgilldaily.com/2014/11/everything-is-problematic>
75. For an extended argument that political activity generally interferes with a scholar's ability to find the truth, see: Van der Vossen (2014).
76. Alexander (2010).
77. Balko (2013).
78. Silvergate (2009).
79. Right on Crime. (n.d.). The conservative case for reform. Retrieved from <http://rightoncrime.com/the-conservative-case-for-reform>
80. Hirsh, M. (2015, March/April). Charles Koch, liberal crusader? *Politico*. Retrieved from <https://www.politico.com/magazine/story/2015/03/charles-koch-overcriminalization-115512>
81. Lilla (2017), p. 9.
82. For an edited version of the interaction in an extraordinary video, see: Now This Politics (Producer). (2017, September 8). This unexpected moment happened when Black Lives Matter activists were invited on stage at a pro-Trump rally [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://www.facebook.com/NowThisNews/videos/1709220972442719>
83. Hains, T. (2017, September 20). "Black Lives Matter" leader wins over Trump supporters: "If we really want America great, we do it together." *Real Clear Politics*. Retrieved from https://www.realclearpolitics.com/video/2017/09/20/black_lives_matter_leader_wins_over_trump_supporters_if_we_really_want_america_great_we_do_it_together.html

Chapter 4: Intimidation and Violence

1. Mandela (2003), p. 545.
2. Warzel, C. (2016, July 19). Twitter permanently suspends Conservative writer Milo Yiannopoulos. *BuzzFeed*. Retrieved from <https://www.buzzfeed.com/charliewarzel/twitter-just-permanently-suspended-conservative-writer-milo>
3. In the words of Milo Yiannopoulos, "Trolling is very important. . . . I like to think of myself as a virtuous troll, you know? I'm doing God's work." Moran, T., Taguchi, E., & Pedersen, C. (2016, September 1). Leslie Jones' Twitter Troll Has No Regrets Over Attacking the 'Ghostbusters' Actress. *ABC News*. Retrieved from <https://abcnews.go.com/Entertainment/leslie-jones-twitter-troll-regrets-attacking-ghostbusters-actress/story?id=41808886>. See also Yiannopoulos' statement: "A real troll, of course, does aim to provoke. They do aim to cause mild rage. They aim to prank, to goad, to wind people up. . . . So trolls, my message to you today is: once the election is over, get off your laptops and head down to your local campus."
4. Yiannopoulos, M. (2016, August 20). Trolls will save the world. *Breitbart*. Retrieved from <http://www.breitbart.com/milo/2016/08/20/trolls-will-save-world>
5. Scott Crow, former Antifa organizer, explains: "The idea in Antifa is that we go where they [right-wingers] go. That hate speech is not free speech. That if you are endangering people with what you say and the actions that are behind them, then you do not have the right to do that. And so we go to cause conflict, to shut them down where they are." See Suerth, J. (2017, August 17). What is Antifa? *CNN*. Retrieved from <https://www.cnn.com/2017/08/14/us/what-is-antifa-trnd/index.html>

5. Kell, G. (2017, February 2). Campus investigates, assesses damage from Feb. 1 violence. *Berkeley News*. Retrieved from <http://news.berkeley.edu/2017/02/02/campus-investigates-assesses-damage-from-feb-1-violence>
6. Lochner, T. (2017, February 1). UC Berkeley: Protesters shut down Milo Yiannopoulos event, clash with police. *East Bay Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.eastbaytimes.com/2017/02/01/uc-berkeley-cancels-breitbart-provocateur-milo-yiannopoulos-event>
7. Park, M., & Lah, K. (2017, February 2). Berkeley protests of Yiannopoulos caused \$100,000 in damage. *CNN*. Retrieved from <http://www.cnn.com/2017/02/01/us/milo-yiannopoulos-berkeley/index.html>
8. Riot forces cancellation of Yiannopoulos talk at UC Berkeley. (2017, February 1). *CBS SF Bay Area*. Retrieved from <http://sanfrancisco.cbslocal.com/2017/02/01/berkeley-braces-for-protests-at-yiannopoulos-talk>
9. Park & Lah (2017); see n. 7.
10. Arnold, C. (2017, February 1). Violence and chaos erupt at UC–Berkeley in protest against Milo Yiannopoulos. *USA Today College*. Retrieved from <http://college.usatoday.com/2017/02/01/violence-and-chaos-erupt-at-uc-berkeley-in-protest-against-milo-yiannopoulos>
11. Riot forces cancellation (2017); see n. 8.
12. Rioters break windows, set fire to force cancellation of Breitbart editor’s UC–Berkeley talk. (2017, February 1). *Fox News*. Retrieved from <http://www.foxnews.com/us/2017/02/01/rioters-break-windows-set-fire-to-force-cancellation-breitbart-editors-uc-berkeley-talk.html>
13. RTQuestionsMore (Producer). (2017, February 1). Kiara Robles talks to RT International [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SUQdlc8Gc-g&feature=youtu.be>
14. Park & Lah (2017); see n. 7.
15. CNBC with Reuters and AP. (2017, February 1). Trump threatens UC Berkeley with funds cut after Breitbart editor’s speech is canceled following riot. *CNBC*. Retrieved from <https://www.cnbcm.com/2017/02/01/uc-berkeley-on-lockdown-amid-protest-over-milo-yiannopoulos.html>
16. “The demonstrators caused an estimated \$100,000 in damage on campus, the university said, and an additional \$400,000 to \$500,000 elsewhere, according to Downtown Berkeley Association CEO John Caner.” Kutner, M. (2017, February 1). Inside the black bloc protest strategy that shut down Berkeley. *Newsweek*. Retrieved from <http://www.newsweek.com/2017/02/24/berkeley-protest-milo-yiannopoulos-black-bloc-556264.html>
17. Freedman, W. (2017, February 1). VIDEO: Trump supporter pepper sprayed at Milo protest. *ABC 7 News*. Retrieved from <http://abc7news.com/news/video-trump-supporter-pepper-sprayed-at-milo-protest/1733004>
18. Mackey, R. (2017, February 4). Amid the chaos in Berkeley, a grinning face, covered in blood. *The Intercept*. Retrieved from <https://theintercept.com/2017/02/04/amid-chaos-berkeley-grinning-face-covered-blood>
19. Freedman (2017); see n. 17.
20. K. Redelsheimer & J. Jennings (personal communication, March 1, 2017). See also: Fabian, P. (Producer). (2017, February 2). Protestors beating people at Milo Yiannopoulos event @ U.C. Berkeley [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GSMKGRyWKas>
21. K. Redelsheimer (personal communication, March 1, 2017).

22. Gale, J. (2017, February). EXCLUSIVE FOOTAGE: Anarchists smash windows and riot at UC Berkeley after Milo Yiannopoulos's talk is canceled. *The Tab*. Retrieved from <http://thetab.com/us/uc-berkeley/2017/02/02/exclusive-footage-anarchist-group-smashes-windows-sets-fire-sprout-riots-uc-berkeley-milo-yiannopoulos-talk-cancelled-3244>
23. P. Jandhyala (personal communication, July 11, 2017).
24. UC Berkeley Campus Police tweeted: @UCBerkeley Milo event cancelled. Shelter in place if on campus. All campus buildings on lockdown. #miloatcal. Retrieved from https://twitter.com/ucpd_cal/status/826978649341440000?lang=en
25. Riot forces cancellation (2017); see n. 8.
26. Zoppo, A., Proença Santos, A., & Hudgins, J. (2017, February 14). Here's the full list of Donald Trump's executive orders. *NBC News*. Retrieved from <https://www.nbcnews.com/politics/white-house/here-s-full-list-donald-trump-s-executive-orders-n720796>
27. Helsel, P. (2017, February 2). Protests, violence prompt UC Berkeley to cancel Milo Yiannopoulos event. *NBC News*. Retrieved from <https://www.nbcnews.com/news/us-news/protests-violence-prompts-uc-berkeley-cancel-milo-yiannopoulos-event-n715711>
28. Lawrence, N. (2017, February 7). Black bloc did what campus should have. *The Daily Californian*. Retrieved from <http://www.dailycal.org/2017/02/07/black-bloc-campus>. See also a similar claim: Meagley, D. (2017, February 7). Condemning protesters same as condoning hate speech. *The Daily Californian*. Retrieved from <http://www.dailycal.org/2017/02/07/condemning-protesters-condoning-hate-speech>
29. When we contacted the UC Berkeley Office of Public Affairs, it refused to disclose whether any students had been disciplined by the university in connection with the protests, citing federal privacy laws. It later clarified that, in the month of February, two students were arrested: one for vandalism and one for failure to disperse. As far as we can tell, no students were punished by the university in any way, so there was no punishment that would act as a deterrent for future violent protests.
30. Bodley, M. (2017, February 2). At Berkeley Yiannopoulos protest, \$100,000 in damage, 1 arrest. *SFGate*. Retrieved from <http://www.sfgate.com/crime/article/At-Berkeley-Yiannopoulos-protest-100-000-in-10905217.php>. See also: Berkeley free speech protests: Arrests, injuries, damages since February. (2017, April 25). *Fox News*. Retrieved from <http://www.foxnews.com/politics/2017/04/25/berkeley-free-speech-protests-arrests-injuries-damages-since-february.html>
31. In 2016, at California State University, Los Angeles, the university president canceled a speech about diversity by conservative Ben Shapiro, requiring that, instead, he "appear as part of a group of speakers with differing viewpoints on diversity" (something that had not been required of any other recent speakers). Eventually, the president relented, but at the event, students locked arms to prevent people from getting in. Some who tried to enter were pushed to the ground. After UC Berkeley failed to prevent violence on campus in February 2017, and Ben Shapiro was scheduled to speak there later in the year, threats of violence in response to his presence required approximately \$600,000 of security. At least nine people were arrested, three of them reportedly for "banned weapons" (including an oversized cardboard sign), but otherwise Shapiro spoke without incident. (In 2016, Shapiro had spoken at Berkeley without significant protest.) See: Logue, J. (2016, February 24). Another Speaker Blocked. *Inside Higher Ed*. Retrieved from <https://www.insidehighered.com/news/2016/02/24/cal-state-los-angeles>

[cancels-conservative-speakers-appearance](#) See also: Steinbaugh, A. (2016, February 26). CSU Los Angeles President Fails to Prevent Shapiro Talk, But Protesters Try Their Hardest Anyway. *FIRE*. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/csu-los-angeles-president-fails-to-prevent-shapiro-talk-but-protesters-try-their-hardest-anyway> . See also: Gomez, M. (2017, September 15). Nine people arrested at Ben Shapiro event at UC Berkeley. *The Mercury News*. Retrieved from <https://www.mercurynews.com/2017/09/15/nine-people-arrested-at-ben-shapiro-event-at-uc-berkeley>. See also: Alliance Defending Freedom. (2017, February 28). Cal State L.A. agrees to drop discriminatory speech policies, settles lawsuit. Retrieved from <https://adflegal.org/detailspages/press-release-details/cal-state-l.a.-agrees-to-drop-discriminatory-speech-policies-settles-lawsuit>. See also: UC Berkeley declares itself unsafe for Ann Coulter. (2017, April 20). *The Atlantic*. Retrieved from <https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2017/04/uc-berkeley-declares-itself-unsafe-for-ann-coulter/523668>. See also: Fehely, D. (2017, April 11). Conservative writer David Horowitz’s talk at UC Berkeley cancelled. *CBS SF Bay Area*. Retrieved from <http://sanfrancisco.cbslocal.com/2017/04/11/uc-berkeley-presses-campus-republicans-to-cancel-another-conservative-speaker>. See also: McPhate, M. (2017, September 15). California today: Price tag to protect speech at Berkeley: \$600,000. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/09/15/us/california-today-price-tag-to-protect-speech-at-berkeley-600000.html>

32. Cohen, R. (2017, February 7). What might Mario Savio have said about the Milo protest at Berkeley? *The Nation*. Retrieved from <https://www.thenation.com/article/what-might-mario-savio-have-said-about-the-milo-protest-at-berkeley>

33. Ashenmiller, J. (2013). Mario Savio. *Encyclopaedia Britannica Online*. Retrieved from <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Mario-Savio>

34. Senju, H. (2017, February 7). Violence as self-defense. *The Daily Californian*. Retrieved from <http://www.dailycal.org/2017/02/07/violence-self-defense>

35. Meagley, D. (2017, February 7). Condemning protesters same as condoning hate speech. *The Daily Californian*. Retrieved from <http://www.dailycal.org/2017/02/07/condemning-protesters-condoning-hate-speech>

36. Dang, N. (2017, February 7). Check your privilege when speaking of protests. *The Daily Californian*. Retrieved from <http://www.dailycal.org/2017/02/07/check-privilege-speaking-protests>

37. Overpass Light Brigade. (2016, December 14). Hate’s insidious face: UW–Milwaukee and the “alt-right.” Retrieved from <http://overpasslightbrigade.org/hates-insidious-face-uw-milwaukee-and-the-alt-right>

38. Lawrence (2017); see n. 28.

39. Villasenor, J. (2017, September 18). Views among college students regarding the First Amendment: Results from a new survey. Retrieved from <https://www.brookings.edu/blog/fixgov/2017/09/18/views-among-college-students-regarding-the-first-amendment-results-from-a-new-survey>. For criticism, see: Beckett, L. (2017, September 22). “Junk science”: Experts cast doubt on widely cited college free speech survey. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from <https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2017/sep/22/college-free-speech-violence-survey-junk-science>. For Villasenor’s response, see: Volokh, E. (2017, October 23). Freedom of expression on campus: An overview of some recent surveys. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from

<https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/volokh-conspiracy/wp/2017/10/23/freedom-of-expression-on-campus-an-overview-of-some-recent-surveys>

40. McLaughlin, J., & Schmidt, R. (2017, September 28). National Undergraduate Study. *McLaughlin & Associates*. Retrieved from

<http://c8.nrostatic.com/sites/default/files/NATL%20Undergrad%209-27-17%20Presentation%20%281%29.pdf>

41. McWhorter, J. (2017, June 30). A Columbia professor's critique of campus politics. *The Atlantic*. Retrieved from <https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2017/06/a-columbia-professors-critique-of-campus-politics/532335>

42. "The idea is that if you go against a certain orthodoxy, then it isn't only that you disagree, but that you also wish white people were still in charge, that you want people of color to sit down and shut up." See: McWhorter, J. (2016, November 29). The difference between racial bias and white supremacy. *Time*. Retrieved from <http://time.com/4584161/white-supremacy>

43. Stack, L. (2017, January 21). Attack on alt-right leader has internet asking: Is it O.K. to punch a Nazi? *The New York Times*. Retrieved from

<https://www.nytimes.com/2017/01/21/us/politics/richard-spencer-punched-attack.html>

44. In fact, we can make a prediction right now, while writing this book in 2017: Most of the negative reviews and responses to this book will at some point note our race and gender and then directly assert or vaguely hint that we are racists or sexists who are motivated primarily by the desire to preserve our privilege. We will then respond in the spirit of Mark Lilla, the author of a critique of identity politics titled *The Once and Future Liberal*. Lilla, an avowed liberal who wrote his book to help the Democrats start winning elections, responds to repeated name-calling by saying, essentially, "That is a slur, not an argument. Make an argument and I'll respond to it." See, for example, Goldstein, E. R. (2016, December 15). Campus identity

politics is dooming liberal causes, a professor charges. *Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <https://www.chronicle.com/article/Campus-Identity-Politics-Is/238694>

45. See, for example, the extraordinary success of J. D. Vance's 2016 book *Hillbilly Elegy* and Arlie Russell Hochschild's 2016 book *Strangers in Their Own Land*, which covered some similar ground.

46. Goodnow, N., & Pethokoukis, J. (2014, October 16). "The Bell Curve" 20 years later: A Q&A with Charles Murray. *American Enterprise Institute*. Retrieved from

<http://www.aei.org/publication/bell-curve-20-years-later-qa-charles-murray>

47. Stanger, A. (2017, March 13). Understanding the angry mob at Middlebury that gave me a concussion. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from

<https://www.nytimes.com/2017/03/13/opinion/understanding-the-angry-mob-that-gave-me-a-concussion.html>

48. Independent, A. (2017, March 6). Middlebury College professor injured by protesters as she escorted controversial speaker. *Addison County Independent*. Retrieved from

<http://www.addisonindependent.com/201703middlebury-college-professor-injured-protesters-she-escorted-controversial-speaker>

49. Seelye, K. (2017, March 3). Protesters disrupt speech by "Bell Curve" author at Vermont College. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from

<https://www.nytimes.com/2017/03/03/us/middlebury-college-charles-murray-bell-curve-protest.html>

50. Independent (2017); see n. 48.

51. Murray, C. (2017, March 5). Reflections on the revolution in Middlebury. *American Enterprise Institute*. Retrieved from <http://www.aei.org/publication/reflections-on-the-revolution-in-middlebury>
52. A. Stanger (personal communication, January 5, 2018). Note that the mob at Middlebury appears to have been composed primarily of Middlebury students. In total, seventy-four students were disciplined: forty-eight were sanctioned for events during the lecture, and twenty-six received some form of punishment for their participation in the events after the main lecture disruption. See: Middlebury College completes sanctioning process for March 2 disruptions. (2017, May 23). Retrieved from <http://www.middlebury.edu/newsroom/archive/2017-news/node/547896>
53. Stanger (2017); see n. 47.
54. Blume, H. (2017, April 9). Protesters disrupt talk by pro-police author, sparking free-speech debate at Claremont McKenna College. *Los Angeles Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.latimes.com/local/lanow/la-me-ln-macdonald-claremont-speech-disrupted-20170408-story.html>
55. Wootson, C. R., Jr. (2017, April 10). She wanted to criticize Black Lives Matter in a college speech. A protest shuts her down. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/grade-point/wp/2017/04/10/she-wanted-to-criticize-black-lives-matter-in-a-college-speech-a-protest-shut-her-down>
56. Gross, N. (2016, September 30). Is there a “Ferguson Effect”? *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2016/10/02/opinion/sunday/is-there-a-ferguson-effect.html>
57. ShutDown Anti-Black Fascists. (2017, April). SHUT DOWN anti-black fascist Heather Mac Donald [onFacebook] [via archive.is webpage capture]. Retrieved from <http://archive.fo/qpbtW>
58. When Jon visited Claremont McKenna College and gave a lecture in that same hall a year later, he learned from faculty members that most of the protesters were not students at Claremont McKenna. The protesters were mostly students at Pomona, Pitzer, and Scripps colleges, which are part of a consortium of five colleges whose students are free to take classes and attend events at all five schools.
59. We, Few of the Black Students Here at Pomona College and the Claremont Colleges. (n.d.). Response to Pomona College president David Oxtoby’s “Academic freedom and free speech” email of April 7, 2017. Archive of Pomona Student Petition [Online document]. Retrieved from https://docs.google.com/document/d/1_y6NmxoIBLcZJxYkN9V1YfaPYzVSMKCA17PgBzz10wk/edit
60. Harris, S. (2017, November 17). The spurious move to stifle speech on campus because it is “dehumanizing.” *Reason*. Retrieved from <http://reason.com/archives/2017/11/17/the-move-to-stifle-speech-on-campus-beca>
61. Linguist John McWhorter says that terms such as these are “tools for injury, not just dictionary terms.” McWhorter, J. (2016, November 29). The difference between racial bias and white supremacy. *Time*. Retrieved from <http://time.com/4584161/white-supremacy>
62. Levenson, E., & Watts, A. (2017, October 13). Man beaten by white supremacists in Charlottesville is arrested. *CNN*. Retrieved from <http://www.cnn.com/2017/10/12/us/charlottesville-deandre-harris-arrest/index.html>
63. Jackman, T. (2017, August 27). Three men charged in Charlottesville attacks on counterprotesters. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from

- https://www.washingtonpost.com/local/public-safety/three-men-charged-in-charlottesville-attacks-on-counterprotesters/2017/08/27/f08930a4-8b5a-11e7-84c0-02cc069f2c37_story.html
64. Raymond, A. K. (2017, December 15). Man who rammed crowd at Charlottesville rally charged with first-degree murder. *New York*. Retrieved from <http://nymag.com/daily/intelligencer/2017/12/first-degree-murder-charge-for-man-who-killed-heather-heyer.html>
65. Caron, C. (2017, August 13). Heather Heyer, Charlottesville victim, is recalled as “a strong woman.” *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/08/13/us/heather-heyer-charlottesville-victim.html>
66. Buncombe, A. (2017, December 15). Heather Heyer was buried in secret grave to protect it from neo-Nazis after Charlottesville, reveals mother. *The Independent*. Retrieved from <http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/americas/heather-heyer-grave-secret-hide-nazis-charlottesville-attack-mother-reveals-a8113056.html>
67. Nelson, L., & Swanson, K. (2017, August 15). Full transcript: Donald Trump’s press conference defending the Charlottesville rally. *Vox*. Retrieved from <https://www.vox.com/2017/8/15/16154028/trump-press-conference-transcript-charlottesville>
68. See Jon’s narration and interpretation of these events as an example of sacrilege and taboo violation: Haidt, J. (2017, August 21). Trump breaks a taboo—and pays the price. *The Atlantic*. Retrieved from <https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2017/08/what-happens-when-the-president-commits-sacrilege/537519>
69. See, for example, Phillip, A. (2017, August 17). Trump’s isolation grows in the wake of Charlottesville. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/trumps-isolation-grows-in-the-wake-of-charlottesville/2017/08/17/5bf83952-81ec-11e7-82a4-920da1aeb507_story.html
70. Some religious groups did just this, beginning on the day of the Charlottesville march, when a large coalition of religious leaders locked arms, faced down the heavily armed racists, and sang about love. See: Jenkins, J. (2017, August 16). Meet the clergy who stared down white supremacists in Charlottesville. Retrieved from <https://thinkprogress.org/clergy-in-charlottesville-e95752415c3e>
71. Stevens, S. (2017, February 7). Campus speaker disinvitations: Recent trends (Part 2 of 2) [Blog post]. Retrieved from <https://heterodoxacademy.org/2017/02/07/campus-speaker-disinvitations-recent-trends-part-2-of-2>
72. Bauer-Wolf, J. (2017, October 5). ACLU speaker shouted down at William & Mary. *Inside Higher Ed*. Retrieved from <https://www.insidehighered.com/quicktakes/2017/10/05/aclu-speaker-shouted-down-william-mary>
73. Sullivan, S. (2017, October 19). Jane Doe wants an abortion but the government is hell bent on stopping her [Blog post]. Retrieved from <https://www.aclu.org/blog/immigrants-rights/immigrants-rights-and-detention/jane-doe-wants-abortion-government-hell-bent>
74. Stern, M. J. (2014, September 3). Translating terrorism: Is publishing radical Islamic texts on the internet a crime? *Slate*. Retrieved from http://www.slate.com/articles/technology/future_tense/2014/09/mehanna_at_the_supreme_court_is_translating_jihad_texts_a_crime.html
75. Glasser, I. (2017, August 22). Thinking constitutionally about Charlottesville. *HuffPost*. Retrieved from https://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/aclu-charlottesville-free-speech_us_599c9bcae4b0d8dde9998c36

76. Truitt, F. (2017, October 2). Black Lives Matter protests American Civil Liberties Union. *The Flat Hat*. Retrieved from <http://flathatnews.com/2017/10/02/black-lives-matter-protests-american-civil-liberties-union>
77. Carey, E. (2017, October 6). President Schill speech suspended by protesting students. *Daily Emerald*. Retrieved from <https://www.dailyemerald.com/2017/10/06/president-schill-speech-suspended-protesting-students>
78. Schill, M. (2017, October 3). The misguided student crusade against “fascism.” *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/10/23/opinion/fascism-protest-university-oregon.html>
79. Leou, R. (2017, October 17). Panelists discuss constitutional rights in first Free Speech 101 event. *Daily Bruin*. Retrieved from <http://dailybruin.com/2017/10/17/panelists-discuss-constitutional-rights-in-first-free-speech-101-event>
80. Kolman, J. (2017, October 13). Class struggle: How identity politics divided a campus. *Spiked*. Retrieved from <http://www.spiked-online.com/newsite/article/how-identity-politics-divided-reed-college-black-lives-matter-free-speech/20417>
81. Mendelsohn, D. (2015, March 16). Girl, interrupted: Who was Sappho? *The New Yorker*. Retrieved from <https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2015/03/16/girl-interrupted>
82. Reedges Against Racism. (2016, November 2). An open letter to Lucia [on Facebook]. Retrieved from <https://www.facebook.com/reedgesagainstr4cism/posts/1186608438084694>
83. Martínez Valdivia, L. (2017, October 27). Professors like me can’t stay silent about this extremist moment on campuses. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/professors-like-me-cant-stay-silent-about-this-extremist-moment-on-campuses/2017/10/27/fd7aded2-b9b0-11e7-9e58-e6288544af98_story.html. For more on intimidation at Reed College, see Soave, R. (2016, December 13). Reed College professor on social justice left: “I am a gay mixed-race woman. I am intimidated by these students” [Blog post]. Retrieved from <http://reason.com/blog/2016/12/13/reed-college-professor-on-social-justice>. And note this comment that Martínez Valdivia made on December 8, 2016, early in the protests: “I teach at Reed. I am intimidated by these students. I am scared to teach courses on race, gender, or sexuality, or even texts that bring these issues up in any way—and I am a gay mixed-race woman. There is a serious problem here and at other [liberal arts colleges], and I’m at a loss as to how to begin to address it, especially since many of these students don’t believe in either historicity or objective facts. (They denounce the latter as being a tool of the white cisheteropatriarchy.)” Martínez Valdivia, L. [Blog comment, December 8, 2016] Re: Halberstam, J. (2016, December 7). Hiding the tears in my eyes—BOYS DON’T CRY—A legacy. [Blog post]. Retrieved from <https://bullybloggers.wordpress.com/2016/12/07/hiding-the-tears-in-my-eyes-boys-dont-cry-a-legacy-by-jack-halberstam/#comment-13710>
84. Kerr, E. (2018, February 1). “White supremacists are targeting college campuses like never before.” *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <https://www.chronicle.com/article/White-Supremacists-Are/242403>
85. Naughton, K. (2017, October). Speaking freely—What students think about expression at American colleges. *FIRE*. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/publications/student-attitudes-free-speech-survey/student-attitudes-free-speech-survey-full-text/#executiveSummary>
86. De Botton, A. (n.d.). Political correctness vs. politeness. *The School of Life*. Retrieved from <http://www.thebookoflife.org/political-correctness-vs-politeness>

87. Barrett, L. (2017, July 14). When is speech violence? *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/07/14/opinion/sunday/when-is-speech-violence.html>
88. Haidt, J., & Lukianoff, G. (2017, July 18). Why it's a bad idea to tell students words are violence. *The Atlantic*. Retrieved from <https://www.theatlantic.com/education/archive/2017/07/why-its-a-bad-idea-to-tell-students-words-are-violence/533970>
89. Aurelius. *Meditations*, IV:7.
90. Haidt, J. (2017, March 2). Van Jones' excellent metaphors about the dangers of ideological safety [Blog post]. *Heterodox Academy*. Retrieved from <https://heterodoxacademy.org/2017/03/02/van-jones-excellent-metaphors>

Chapter 5: Witch Hunts

1. Hoffer (1951/2010), p. 19.
2. Pavlac (2009).
3. Pavlac (2009).
4. Norton (2007), Introduction.
5. Norton (2007), Introduction.
6. Durkheim (1915/1965). For an updated analysis of the joys of collective action and group ritual, see also: Ehrenreich (2006).
7. Bergesen (1978).
8. For an overview of the Cultural Revolution, see: MacFarquhar & Schoenhals (2006). See also this interview with a woman who joined the Red Guard at age thirteen: Xiangzhen, Y. (2016, May 15). Confessions of a Red Guard, 50 years after China's Cultural Revolution. Retrieved from <http://www.cnn.com/2016/05/15/asia/china-cultural-revolution-red-guard-confession/index.html>
9. Song, Y. (2011, August 25). Chronology of mass killings during the Chinese Cultural Revolution (1966–1976). *SciencesPo*. Retrieved from <http://www.sciencespo.fr/mass-violence-war-massacre-resistance/en/document/chronology-mass-killings-during-chinese-cultural-revolution-1966-1976>
10. Bergesen (1978), p. 20.
11. Bergesen (1978), p. 20.
12. Bergesen (1978), p. 21.
13. For example, see TheDemands.org, a site that arose within a few weeks of the 2015 Yale protests, at which students from eighty universities posted their demands.
14. See chapter 3. See also: Friedersdorf, C. (2016, May 26). The perils of writing a provocative email at Yale. *The Atlantic*. Retrieved from <https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2016/05/the-peril-of-writing-a-provocative-email-at-yale/484418>
15. See chapter 3. See also: Haidt, J. (2015, November 18). True diversity requires generosity of spirit [Blog post]. Retrieved from <https://heterodoxacademy.org/2015/11/18/true-diversity-requires-generosity-of-spirit>
16. DiGravio, W. (Publisher). (2017, March 2). Students protest lecture by Dr. Charles Murray at Middlebury College [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=a6EASuhfeI>
17. Wiltermuth & Heath (2009). See also: Cohen, Ejsmond-Frey, Knight, & Dunbar (2009).

18. See Woodard (2011). The culture of safetyism and the most vigorous protests and shout-downs seem to occur mostly in just two of the eleven “nations” that Woodard identifies: Yankeedom (from New England to the upper Midwest) and The Left Coast (the coastal strip of the three West Coast states).
19. Tuvel (2017).
20. Johnson, K., Pérez-Peña, R., & Eligon, J. (2015, June 16). Rachel Dolezal, in center of storm, is defiant: “I identify as black.” *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2015/06/17/us/rachel-dolezal-nbc-today-show.html>
21. See <https://www.rhodes.edu/bio/tuvelr>
22. Open letter to Hypatia. (n.d.). Retrieved from <https://archive.is/IUeR4#selection-71.0-71.22>
23. Note: A new paragraph with the sentence “The statement is not an exhaustive summary of the many harms caused by this article” was added to the open letter at approximately the 520th signature, on 5/1/2017. See: Open letter to Hypatia. (n.d.). Retrieved from https://docs.google.com/forms/d/1efp9C0MHch_6Kfgt1m0PZ76nirWtcEsqWHcvgidl2mU/viewform?ts=59066d20&edit_requested=true
24. Tuvel referred to Caitlyn Jenner as “Caitlyn (formerly Bruce) Jenner.” “Deadnaming” is a term used to deride the practice of referring to transgender people by their former, “dead” names. The online version of the article was edited after publication, on May 4, 2017, and the correction reads in part: “[A]t the author’s request, a parenthetical reference to Jenner’s birth name was removed.” See: Tuvel (2017). It’s worth noting, though, that even Caitlyn Jenner herself insists, “I will refer to the name Bruce when I think it appropriate.” See: Oliver, K. (2017, May 8). If this is feminism . . . *The Philosophical Salon*. Retrieved from <http://thephilosophicalsalon.com/if-this-is-feminism-its-been-hijacked-by-the-thought-police>. See also: Berenstain, N. (2017, April 29). Nora Berenstain on Rebecca Tuvel and Hypatia. *GenderTrender*. Retrieved from <https://gendertrender.wordpress.com/nora-berenstain-on-rebecca-tuvel-and-hypatia>
25. Bergesen (1978), p. 21.
26. Singal, J. (2017, May 2). This is what a modern-day witch hunt looks like. *New York*. Retrieved from <http://nymag.com/daily/intelligencer/2017/05/transracialism-article-controversy.html>
27. Sally Scholz, the editor to whom the open letter was addressed, issued this powerful statement in defense of the publication of Tuvel’s article: “I firmly believe, and this belief will not waver, that it is utterly inappropriate for editors to repudiate an article they have accepted for publication (barring issues of plagiarism or falsification of data). In this respect, editors must stand behind the authors of accepted papers. That is where I stand. Professor Tuvel’s paper went through the peer review process and was accepted by the reviewers and by me.” See: Weinberg, J. (2017, May 6). Hypatia’s editor and its board president defend publication of Tuvel article. *Daily Nous*. Retrieved from <http://dailynous.com/2017/05/06/hypatias-editor-board-president-defend-publication-tuvel-article>
28. Oliver (2017); see n. 24.
29. Outside of feminist philosophy, in the broader philosophical community, many professors did stand up for Tuvel and against the efforts to have her work retracted. The relevant community, from a Durkheimian perspective, was a subset of feminist philosophers.
30. Another open letter of condemnation and demand for retraction was aimed at Bruce Gilley, a political scientist at Portland State University in Oregon, for writing an essay arguing that colonialism conferred some benefits on colonized countries. The article was retracted after the journal editor received death threats. See Patel, V. (2018, March 21). Last fall, this scholar

- defended colonialism. Now he's defending himself. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <https://www.chronicle.com/article/Last-Fall-This-Scholar/242880>
31. Wax, A., & Alexander, L. (2017, August 9). Paying the price for breakdown of the country's bourgeois culture. *The Inquirer*. Retrieved from <http://www.philly.com/philly/opinion/commentary/paying-the-price-for-breakdown-of-the-countrys-bourgeois-culture-20170809.html>
32. Shweder (1996).
33. The letter said that all those who are against hateful ideas about racial superiority "must denounce faculty members that are complicit in and uphold white supremacy" by treating ideas like Wax's as "the very basis for white supremacy." See: Guest column by 54 Penn students & alumni—Statement on Amy Wax and Charlottesville. (2017, August 21). *The Daily Pennsylvanian*. Retrieved from <http://www.thedp.com/article/2017/08/guest-column-amy-wax-charlottesville>
34. Jon wrote a summary of the case and a defense of Wax. See: Haidt, J. (2017, September 2). In defense of Amy Wax's defense of bourgeois values [Blog post]. *Heterodox Academy*. Retrieved from <https://heterodoxacademy.org/2017/09/02/in-defense-of-amy-waxs-defense-of-bourgeois-values>. A few weeks later, the leader of the faculty letter of condemnation, Jonah Gelbach, wrote a long essay responding to the details of the Wax & Alexander essay. See: Haidt, J. (2017, September 21). Jonah Gelbach responds to Amy Wax & Jon Haidt [Blog post]. *Heterodox Academy*. Retrieved from <https://heterodoxacademy.org/2017/09/21/jonah-gelbach-responds-to-wax-and-haidt>
35. Thucydides (431 BCE/1972). Book III, chapter 82, section 4.
36. See: Haidt (2012), chapters 2 and 4.
37. Eggertson (2010).
38. One of the best experiences of Jon's academic career was moderating a bipartisan working group of poverty experts who worked together to strip away partisanship from a complicated research literature and identify the programs that truly work. See: American Enterprise Institute/Brookings Working Group on Poverty and Opportunity. (2015, December 3). Opportunity, Responsibility, and Security. Retrieved from <http://www.aei.org/publication/opportunity-responsibility-and-security>. Chapter 5 evaluates early child-hood interventions.
39. Duarte et al. (2015). See especially: Abramowitz, Gomes, & Abramowitz (1975). See also: Crawford & Jussim (2018).
40. On the personality, political, and behavioral correlates of openness, see: McCrae (1996). See also: Carney, Jost, Gosling, & Potter (2008).
41. Gosling (2008).
42. McClintock, Spaulding, & Turner (1965).
43. For more about the HERI survey, visit <https://heri.ucla.edu>
44. See analysis of all relevant studies prior to 2014 in Duarte et al. (2015). For the most recent data point, seventeen to one, see Langbert, Quain, & Klein (2016).
45. Langbert et al. (2016).
46. According to Langbert et al. (2016), which confirmed an earlier finding about New England using HERI data by Samuel Abrams, see: Abrams, S. J. (2016, July 1). There are conservative professors, just not in these states. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2016/07/03/opinion/sunday/there-are-conservative-professors-just-not-in-these-states.html>

47. Duarte et al. (2015).
48. Of course, a progressive professor could still present conservative ideas. But as John Stuart Mill wrote, “Nor is it enough that he should hear the opinions of adversaries from his own teachers, presented as they state them, and accompanied by what they offer as refutations. He must be able to hear them from persons who actually believe them . . . he must know them in their most plausible and persuasive form.” See: Mill (1859/2003), chapter 2, p. 72.
49. The Crimson Editorial Board. (2016, November 11). Elephant and man at Harvard. *The Harvard Crimson*. Retrieved from <http://www.thecrimson.com/article/2016/11/11/ideological-diversity>
50. Eagen, K., Stolzenberg, E. B., Zimmerman, H. B., Aragon, M. C., Sayson, H. W., & Rios-Aguilar, C. (2018, February 15). The American freshman: National norms fall 2016. *Higher Education Research Institute*. Retrieved from <https://www.heri.ucla.edu/monographs/TheAmericanFreshman2016.pdf>
51. Interestingly, this shift since 2012 is due entirely to a change among women. Male college students have not shifted to the left. Rather, the gender gap, in which women are more left-leaning than men, has widened from roughly 6 points in 2011 to roughly 12 points in 2016. Rempel, C. (2017, May 2). Political polarization among college freshmen is at a record high, as is the share identifying as “far left.” *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/rampage/wp/2017/05/02/political-polarization-among-college-freshmen-is-at-a-record-high-as-is-the-share-identifying-as-far-left>
52. A wave of essays published in March 2018 claimed that nothing on campus had changed with regard to free speech. See, for example: Yglesias, M. (2018, March 12). Everything we think about the political correctness debate is wrong. *Vox*. Retrieved from <https://www.vox.com/policy-and-politics/2018/3/12/17100496/political-correctness-data>. But on closer inspection of the data, Jon and his colleagues at Heterodox Academy showed that there had been many changes in average attitudes toward controversial speech and toward a greater willingness to use illiberal methods to prevent such speech. See: Stevens, S., & Haidt, J. (2018, March 19). The skeptics are wrong: Attitudes about free speech on campus are changing. *Heterodox Academy*. Retrieved from <https://heterodoxacademy.org/skeptics-are-wrong-about-campus-speech>
53. Bestcolleges.com. (n.d.). The 10 most liberal colleges in America. Retrieved from <http://www.bestcolleges.com/features/most-liberal-colleges>
54. Paros, M. (2018, February 22). The Evergreen Meltdown. *Quillette*. Retrieved from <http://quillette.com/2018/02/22/the-evergreen-meltdown>. See Evergreen’s mission here: <http://www.evergreen.edu/about/mission>
55. Weiss, B. (2017, June 1). When the left turns on its own. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/06/01/opinion/when-the-left-turns-on-its-own.html>
56. The Evergreen State College. (n.d.). Day of Absence & Day of Presence. Retrieved January 24, 2018, from <https://evergreen.edu/multicultural/day-of-absence-day-of-presence>
57. Ward (1994). An online version is available here: Ward, D. T. (1965). Day of absence—A satirical fantasy. *National Humanities Center*. Retrieved from <http://nationalhumanitiescenter.org/pds/maai3/protest/text12/warddayofabsence.pdf>
58. Weiss (2017); see n. 55.
59. Jaschik, S. (2017, May 30). Who defines what is racist? *Inside Higher Ed*. Retrieved from <https://www.insidehighered.com/news/2017/05/30/escalating-debate-race-evergreen-state-students-demand-firing-professor>

60. Volokh, E. (2017, May 26). “Professor told he’s not safe on campus after college protests” at Evergreen State College (Washington). *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/volokh-conspiracy/wp/2017/05/26/professor-told-hes-not-safe-on-campus-after-college-protests-at-evergreen-state-university-washington>
61. Long, K. (2017, June 10). Long-simmering discord led to The Evergreen State College’s viral moment. *The Seattle Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.seattletimes.com/seattle-news/education/discord-at-evergreen-state-simmered-for-a-year-before-it-boiled-over>
62. Our source for the events of the prior year is Paros, M. (personal communication, January 10, 2018.) You can watch a video of the imaginary canoe scene, beginning at 1:06, here: The Evergreen State College Productions (Producer). (2016, November 18). Equity and inclusion council community report back [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://youtube.com/watch?v-wPZT7CASvCs&feature-youtu.be&>
63. Weinstein, B. (2017, May 30). The campus mob came for me—and you, professor, could be next. *The Wall Street Journal*. Retrieved from <https://www.wsj.com/articles/the-campus-mob-came-for-me-and-your-professor-could-be-next-1496187482>
64. Haidt, J. (2017, May 27). The blasphemy case against Bret Weinstein, and its four lessons for professors [Blog post]. Retrieved from <https://heterodoxacademy.org/2017/05/27/this-weeks-witch-hunt>
65. Caruso, J., & Gockowski, A. (2017, May 25). VIDEO: White prof harassed for questioning diversity event. *Campus Reform*. Retrieved from <https://www.campusreform.org/?ID=9233>
66. Kaufman, E. (2017, May 26). Another professor, another mob. *National Review*. Retrieved from <http://www.nationalreview.com/article/448034/evergreen-state-pc-mob-accosts-liberal-professor>
67. In an Orwellian example of safetyism combined with the Untruth of Us Versus Them, protesters later described it as forming a “protective ring around the students of color conversing with Weinstein.” Kozak-Gilroy, J. (2017, May 31). A year of events, a time line of protests. *Cooper Point Journal*. Retrieved from <http://www.cooperpointjournal.com/2017/05/31/a-year-of-events-a-time-line-of-protests>. For a civil conversation between Weinstein and protesters after the confrontation, see Lavelle, C. (2017, May 23). This is what a discussion looks like [on Facebook]. Retrieved from <https://www.facebook.com/celeste.lavelle/videos/10203256021397424>
68. Anonymous (personal communication, August 23, 2017).
69. Andy Archive (Producer). (2017, May 28). Black Power activist students demand white professor resigns over “racism” [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://youtu.be/ERd-2HvCOHI?t=4m2s>
70. Boyce, B. (Producer). (2017, June 20). Is Evergreen a cult? [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://youtu.be/VfVRaExw1II?t=4m24s>. See also: Heying, H. (2017, October 2). First, they came for the biologists. *The Wall Street Journal*. Retrieved from <https://www.wsj.com/articles/first-they-came-for-the-biologists-1506984033>
71. Anonymous (personal communication, August 23, 2017).
72. Loury, G., & Weinstein, B. (Producer). (2017, June 30). Glenn Loury & Bret Weinstein— Bloggingheads.tv. [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://bloggingheads.tv/videos/46681>
73. “The protesters did let Bret leave, but they assigned ‘handlers’ to him and his students.” Heying & Weinstein (2017, December 12). Bonfire of the academies: Two professors on how leftist intolerance is killing higher education. *Washington Examiner*. Retrieved from

<https://www.washingtonexaminer.com/bonfire-of-the-academies-two-professors-on-how-leftist-intolerance-is-killing-higher-education>

74. li5up6 (Producer). (2017, May 31). [MIRROR] Student takeover of Evergreen State College. [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=yynnNArPi8GM>
75. VICE (Producer). (2017, June 16). Evergreen State College controversy (HBO) [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://youtu.be/2cMYfxOFBBM?t=2m19s>
76. Heying & Weinstein (2017, December 12); see n. 78. S See also Boyce, B.A. (2017, July 29). Social Network Justice at Evergreen [Video File]. Retrieved from <https://youtu.be/Jye2C5r-QA0?t=8m23s>
77. Sexton, J. (Publisher). (2017, July 13). Evergreen student: “I’ve been told several times that I’m not allowed to speak because I’m white” [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QQ8WQnsm14Y>
78. best of evergreen (Publisher). (2017, May 27). Student takeover of Evergreen State College [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://youtu.be/bO1agIIIlhg?t=6m14s>
79. When asked, they said they were looking for “an individual” but refused to say whom. Campus police concluded they were looking for Bret Weinstein. Anonymous (personal communication, August 23, 2017).
80. Heying & Weinstein (2017, December 12); see n. 73.
81. Kozak-Gilroy (2017); see n. 67.
82. Kozak-Gilroy (2017); see n. 67.
83. I Hypocrite Too (Producer). (2017, May 29). Ableist students demand no homework Evergreen College [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=nh1wGFFsIts>
84. CampusReform (Producer). (2017, June 1). Student protesters at Evergreen hold administrators hostage over demands [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://youtu.be/Msfsp5Ofz4g>
85. In a later VICE News documentary, interviewer Michael Moynihan tells Bridges, “A student told me that you’re a white supremacist.” Bridges replies, “I don’t believe I am.” The astonished Moynihan asks, “You don’t believe you are but you accept that you might be?” Bridges replies, “No . . . well, it depends on what you mean by a white supremacist. What does that mean? I’m a white person in a position of privilege.” VICE (2017); see n. 75.
86. The Liberty Hound (Producer). (2017, May 26). “All white people leave campus OR ELSE!!!” Tucker covers INSANE Evergreen State College story [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://youtu.be/n3SdJhJ2lps?t=4m10s>. The police chief told Weinstein that “he needed to get off campus immediately, and off his bike, too, indefinitely. He was too easy a target on his bike, and the police couldn’t protect him, as they had been ordered to stand down.” Heying & Weinstein (2017, December 12).
87. Anonymous (personal communication, August 23, 2017).
88. Loury & Weinstein (2017); see n. 72. See also: Zimmerman, M. (2017, July 10). The Evergreen State College: Is speaking with Tucker Carlson a punishable offense? HuffPost. Retrieved from https://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/the-evergreen-state-college-is-speaking-with-tucker_us_596318a5e4b0cf3c8e8d59fc. See also: Heying & Weinstein (2017); see n. 73. See also: Kanzenkankaku. (2017, June 1). Protesters lockdown Evergreen State College, situation spirals out of control [Online forum comment]. Retrieved from <http://forums.fstdt.net/index.php?topic=7607.0>. See also: Jaschik (2017); see n. 58.

89. The Liberty Hound (Producer). (2017, June 12). "It's not safe to go back": Tucker follows up with Evergreen prof Bret Weinstein [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SNdNF93H3OU>
90. Not including faculty emeritus.
91. Haidt, J. (2017, June 7). A second Evergreen professor speaks out [Blog post]. Retrieved from <https://heterodoxacademy.org/2017/06/07/a-second-evergreen-professor-speaks-out>
92. "Many members of the faculty were privately supportive, but too scared to speak up, and even too scared to vote their conscience in faculty meetings." Weinstein, B. (personal communication, February 19, 2018).
93. The Liberty Hound (Producer). (2017, May 26). "All white people leave campus OR ELSE!!" Tucker covers INSANE Evergreen State College story [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=n3SdJhJ2lps>
94. Jennings, R. (2017, July 6). N.J. man accused of threat to "execute" college students out of jail. *NJ.com*. Retrieved from http://www.nj.com/morris/index.ssf/2017/07/morris_man_accused_of_threatening_college_3000_mil.html
95. Svrluga, S., & Heim, J. (2017, June 1). Threat shuts down college embroiled in racial dispute. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/grade-point/wp/2017/06/01/threats-shut-down-college-embroiled-in-racial-dispute>. See also: Svrluga, S. (2017, June 5). Evergreen State College closes again after threat and protests over race. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/grade-point/wp/2017/06/05/college-closed-for-third-day-concerned-about-threat-after-protests-over-race>. See also: Jennings (2017); see n. 94.
96. An Evergreen student emailed a professor, "Because I had shown some criticism to the protest that was occurring on campus in earlier weeks I have become targeted and harassed by a wide number of students on campus. Recently there have been a number of students who patrol lower campus with weapons like baseball bats and tasers who claim to be making the campus safer but in reality are making campus more hostile." Kabbany, J. (2017, June 5). Evergreen official asks student vigilantes to stop patrolling campus with bats, batons. *The College Fix*. Retrieved from <https://www.thecollegefix.com/post/33027>
97. The College Fix Staff. (2017, June 2). Evergreen State faculty demand punishment of white professor who refused to leave on anti-white day. *The College Fix*. Retrieved from <https://www.thecollegefix.com/post/32946>. See also: The Liberty Hound (2017, June 12); see n. 89.
98. Thomason, A. (2017, September 16). Evergreen State will pay \$500,000 to settle with professor who criticized handling of protests. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://www.chronicle.com/blogs/ticker/evergreen-state-will-pay-500000-to-settle-with-professor-who-criticized-handling-of-protests/120110>
99. (2018, March 7). Former Evergreen chief of police alleges hostile work environment. *The Cooper Point Journal*. Retrieved from <http://www.cooperpointjournal.com/2018/03/07/former-evergreen-chief-of-police-alleges-hostile-work-environmentstacy-brown-makes-moves-towards-a-legal-claim-of-discrimination-based-on-race-and-gender/>
100. Chasmar, J. (2016, September 2). Evergreen State College president slams Chicago's "tone deaf" approach to safe spaces. *The Washington Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.washingtontimes.com/news/2016/sep/2/george-bridges-wash-college-president-slams-chicag>

101. Jaschik (2017); see n. 59.
102. Richardson, B. (2017, May 29). Evergreen State College president expresses “gratitude” for students who took over campus. *The Washington Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.washingtontimes.com/news/2017/may/29/evergreen-state-college-president-expresses-gratit>
103. Zimmerman, M. (2017, July 25). A “Through the Looking Glass” perspective on The Evergreen State College. *HuffPost*. Retrieved from http://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/a-through-the-looking-glass-perspective-on-the-evergreen_us_5971bd7ae4b06b511b02c271
104. Parke, C. (2017, December 14). Evergreen professor who made anti-white comments resigns, gets \$240G settlement. *Fox News*. Retrieved from <http://www.foxnews.com/us/2017/12/14/evergreen-professor-who-made-anti-white-comments-resigns-gets-240g-settlement.html>
105. best of evergreen (Publisher) (2017, May 27). Student takeover of Evergreen State College [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://youtu.be/bO1agIIIlhg?t=53s>
106. Badger Pundit (Producer). (2017, July 12). Evergreen student: Campus unsafe for white students who want to focus on education [Video file]. Fox News. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pNwVWq8EjSs>

Chapter 6: The Polarization Cycle

1. Reeves, R.V., & Joo, N. (2017, October 4). White, still: The American upper middle class. *Brookings*. Retrieved from <https://www.brookings.edu/blog/social-mobility-memos/2017/10/04/white-still-the-american-upper-middle-class>
2. For evidence of this shift, with a growing preference for inclusion when it is presented as conflicting with freedom of speech, see: Stevens, S., & Haidt, J (2018, March 19). The skeptics are wrong: Attitudes about free speech are changing on campus. *Heterodox Academy*. Retrieved from <https://heterodoxacademy.org/skeptics-are-wrong-about-campus-speech>
3. Stanger, A. (2017, March 13). Understanding the angry mob at Middlebury that gave me a concussion. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/03/13/opinion/understanding-the-angry-mob-that-gave-me-a-concussion.html>
4. Pew Research Center. (2017, October 5). The partisan divide on political values grows even wider. Retrieved from <http://www.people-press.org/2017/10/05/1-partisan-divides-over-political-values-widen>
5. With the exception that Republicans’ ratings of their own party dipped in 2016.
6. You can download the data yourself at <http://www.electionstudies.org>.
7. There were plenty of cultural conflicts, particularly in the 1960s and 1970s, but measures of political polarization in Congress were low; cross-partisan cooperation was high. Hare & Poole (2014).
8. See Putnam (2000) on social capital.
9. Greenblatt, A. (2016, November 18). Political segregation is growing and “We’re living with the consequences.” *Governing*. Retrieved from <http://www.governing.com/topics/politics/gov-bill-bishop-interview.html>
10. For example, in a September 2017 survey of adults aged eighteen to thirty-four, only 11% of African Americans, 18% of Asian Americans, and 20% of Latino Americans had very or somewhat favorable views of the Republican Party. By contrast, those groups had a favorable

view of the Democratic Party: 61%, 68%, and 52%, respectively. See: NBC News & GenForward Survey: September 2017 Toplines, p.4. Retrieved from <http://genforwardsurvey.com/assets/uploads/2017/09/NBC-GenForward-Toplines-September-2017-Final.pdf>

11. Iyengar & Krupenkin (2018).

12. Pariser (2011). A “filter bubble” is what happens when the algorithms that websites use to predict your interests based on your reading/viewing habits work to avoid showing you alternative viewpoints. See: El-Bermawy, M. (2016, November 18). Your filter bubble is destroying democracy. *Wired*. Retrieved from <https://www.wired.com/2016/11/filter-bubble-destroying-democracy>

13. Mann & Ornstein (2012).

14. Levitsky, S., & Ziblatt, D. (2018, January 27). How wobbly is our democracy? *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/01/27/opinion/sunday/democracy-polarization.html>

15. Others include increasing education (educated people are more partisan), increasing immigration and diversity, and the increasing importance of money in campaigns. See a list at Haidt, J., & Abrams, S. (2015, January 7). The top 10 reasons American politics are so broken. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from

<https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/wonk/wp/2015/01/07/the-top-10-reasons-american-politics-are-worse-than-ever>

16. Iyengar & Krupenkin (2018), p. 202.

17. Berry & Sobieraj (2014).

18. Cillizza, C. (2014, May 14). Just 7 percent of journalists are Republicans. That’s far fewer than even a decade ago. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from

<https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/the-fix/wp/2014/05/06/just-7-percent-of-journalists-are-republicans-thats-far-less-than-even-a-decade-ago>

19. Littleton, J. (2017, May 29). The truth about the Evergreen protests. *Medium*. Retrieved from <https://medium.com/@princessofthefaeries666/the-truth-about-the-evergreen-protests-444c86ee6307>

20. Littleton, J. (2017, June 16). The media brought the alt-right to my campus. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from https://www.nytimes.com/2017/06/16/opinion/media-alt-right-evergreen-college.html?_r=0. See also: Pemberton, L. (2017, July 13). Evergreen students, faculty, and alumni hold discussion after unrest. *The Chronicle*. Retrieved from

http://www.chronline.com/news/evergreen-students-faculty-and-alumni-hold-discussion-after-unrest/article_c9d9f5f8-67ef-11e7-8b53-5ff0ef03700b.html

21. Long, K. (2017, June 5). Evergreen State College reopens; threat deemed not credible. The Seattle Times. Retrieved from <https://www.seattletimes.com/seattle-news/education/no-imminent-threat-at-evergreen-state-college-after-classes-canceled-for-third-day>

22. Atomwaffen division visits Evergreen State College. (n.d.). Retrieved from <https://www.bitchute.com/video/bZMiTj2TC5bf>

23. TheFIREorg [Producer]. (2018, February 8). Lisa Durden on her famous Fox News interview [Video file]. Retrieved from

https://www.youtube.com/watch?time_continue=310&v=PfmdlqDC3mE

24. L. Durden (personal communication, March 24, 2018).

25. In his statement, the newly appointed college president claimed that the college had been “immediately inundated with feedback from students, faculty and prospective students and their

families expressing frustration, concern and even fear” about “the views expressed by a College employee,” and said the college had a “responsibility to investigate those concerns.” The president declared that the college “supports and affirms the right of free speech and independent views and expressions of those views for our faculty and staff” and that his “administration has a duty to set a strong example of tolerance.” Statement from Essex

County College president Anthony E. Munroe. (2017, June 23). Retrieved from

<http://www.essex.edu/pr/2017/06/23/statement-from-essex-county-college-president-anthony-e-munroe-3>

26. What about the feedback that the college was “inundated” with? Public records indicate that for the first thirteen days after Durden’s television appearance, only one person contacted the college to complain about Durden—and even before that person contacted the college, administrators had already started the process that led to her suspension. Two weeks after her appearance, the website NJ.com announced that Durden had been suspended. Shortly thereafter, administrators received twenty-nine emails, two Facebook messages, an unknown number of phone calls, and a single voicemail supporting the college for suspending “a teacher who wants to spew hate speech covered up by free speech.” You can listen to the entire voicemail here: TheFIREorg [Producer]. (2017, January 21). Essex County College voicemail about Lisa Durden [Audio file]. Retrieved from <https://youtu.be/pTYM30Q4NsE>. See: Steinbaugh, A. (2018, January 23). After FIRE lawsuit, Essex County College finally turns over documents about firing of Black Lives Matter advocate. *FIRE*. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/after-fire-lawsuit-essex-county-college-finally-turns-over-documents-about-firing-of-black-lives-matter-advocate>.

See also: Carter, B. (2017, June 20). Going on Fox News cost me my job, professor claims.

NJ.com. Retrieved from

http://www.nj.com/essex/index.ssf/2017/06/essex_county_college_professor_suspended_after_fox.html

27. Flaherty, C. (2017, June 21). Suspended for standing up to Fox News? *Inside Higher Ed*.

Retrieved from <https://www.insidehighered.com/news/2017/06/21/college-allegedly-suspends-communications-adjunct-comments-about-race-fox-news>. See also: Adely, H. (2017, October

27). For speaking out, N.J. professors are punished. *North Jersey*. Retrieved from

<https://www.northjersey.com/story/news/2017/10/27/professors-punished-for-speaking-out/777819001>. See also: Steinbaugh, A. (2018, January 23). After

FIRE lawsuit, Essex County College finally turns over documents about firing of Black Lives

Matter advocate. *FIRE*. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/after-fire-lawsuit-essex-county-college-finally-turns-over-documents-about-firing-of-black-lives-matter-advocate>

28. Steinbaugh, A. (2017, October 20). Russia-linked Twitter account helped Drexel professor’s “White Genocide” tweet go viral, prompting university investigation. *FIRE*. Retrieved from

<https://www.thefire.org/russia-linked-twitter-account-helped-drexel-professors-white-genocide-tweet-go-viral-prompting-university-investigation>

29. Saffron, I. (2017, December 27). How a Drexel prof’s Christmas “wish” stirred a Twitter tempest. *Philly.com*. Retrieved from

http://www.philly.com/philly/news/20161227_How_a_Drexel_prof_s_Christmas_wish_stirred_a_Twitter_tempest.html

30. McLaughlin, S. (2017, December 29). Drexel professor resigns after months-long

investigation, exile from campus. *FIRE*. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/drexel-professor-resigns-after-months-long-investigation-exile-from-campus>

31. Thomason, A. (2017, December 28). Drexel professor whose charged tweets drew fire from the right will leave the university. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <https://www.chronicle.com/article/Drexel-Professor-Whose-Charged/242124>
32. Cornwell, P. (2017, June 1). Princeton professor cancels Seattle talk after Fox News segment, death threats. *The Seattle Times*. (Updated June 2, 2017). Retrieved from <https://www.seattletimes.com/seattle-news/princeton-professor-cancels-seattle-talk-after-fox-news-segment-death-threats>. See also: Trump a “racist, sexist megalomaniac,” Princeton prof says in commencement speech. (2017, May 28). *Fox News*. Retrieved from <http://www.foxnews.com/us/2017/05/28/trump-racist-sexist-megalomaniac-princeton-prof-says-in-commencement-speech.html>
33. Haymarket Books. (2017, May 31). A statement from Keeanga-Yamahtta Taylor [Facebook post]. Retrieved from <https://www.facebook.com/haymarketbooks/posts/1494045207312386>
34. Bond, S.E. (2017, June 7). Why we need to start seeing the classical world in color. *Hyperallergic*. Retrieved from <https://hyperallergic.com/383776/why-we-need-to-start-seeing-the-classical-world-in-color>
35. Gurewitsch, M. (2008, July). True colors: Archaeologist Vinzenz Brinkmann insists his eye-popping reproductions of ancient Greek sculptures are right on target. *Smithsonian Magazine*. Retrieved from <https://www.smithsonianmag.com/arts-culture/true-colors-17888>
36. For example, American white supremacist group Identity Evropa tweeted a poster of a marble statue with the caption “PROTECT YOUR HERITAGE.” @IdentityEvropa. (2016, November 3). Seattle has never looked better. #FashTheCity [Tweet]. Retrieved from <http://web.archive.org/web/20171115062648/https://twitter.com/IdentityEvropa/status/794368750346588160>. Cited in Bond (2017); see n. 34.
37. Of course, Bond said neither of these things. Hoft, J. (2017, July 18). University prof: Using white marble in sculptures is racist and creates “white supremacy.” *Gateway Pundit*. Retrieved from <http://www.thegatewaypundit.com/2017/07/university-prof-using-white-marble-sculptures-racist-creates-white-supremacy>. See also: Jackson, D. (2017, June 8). Prof: “White marble” in artwork contributes to white supremacy. *Campus Reform*. Retrieved from <https://www.campusreform.org/?ID=9285>. See also: Krayden, D. (2017, June 10). Professor equates white marble statues with white supremacy. *The Daily Caller*. Retrieved from <http://dailycaller.com/2017/06/10/professor-equates-white-marble-statues-with-white-supremacy>
38. Mikelionis, L. (2017, June 9). Iowa university professor says “white marble” actually influences “white supremacist” ideas. *Education News*. Retrieved from <http://www.educationviews.org/iowa-university-professor-white-marble-influences-white-supremacist-ideas>
39. Osgerby, P. (2017, June 19). UI professor receives death threats over article on classical art. *Little Village*. Retrieved from <http://littlevillagemag.com/ui-professor-receives-death-threats-over-article-on-classical-art>
40. Charis-Carlson, J. (2017, June 19). UI prof’s post on ancient statues, white supremacists elicits death threats. *Iowa City Press-Citizen*. Retrieved from <https://www.press-citizen.com/story/news/2017/06/16/ui-classics-professor-receives-threats-after-online-essay-statuary-race/403275001>. See also: Quintana, C. (2017, June 16). For one scholar, an online stoning tests the limits of public scholarship. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <https://www.chronicle.com/article/For-One-Scholar-an-Online/240384>
41. Allen, C. (2017, June 26). Liberal professors say bizarre things—and then blame the conservative media for reporting on them. *Independent Women’s Forum*. Retrieved from

<http://iwf.org/blog/2804174/Liberal-Professors-Say-Bizarre-Things--and-Then-Blame-the-Conservative-Media-for-Reporting-on-Them>

42. See Haidt, J. (2017, June 28). Professors must now fear intimidation from both sides. *Heterodox Academy*. Retrieved from <https://heterodoxacademy.org/professors-must-now-fear-intimidation-from-both-sides>

43. Schmidt, P. (2017, June 22). Professors' growing risk: Harassment for things they never really said. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <https://www.chronicle.com/article/Professors-Growing-Risk-/240424?cid=rclink>

44. Haidt, J. (2017, April 26). Intimidation is the new normal on campus. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <https://www.chronicle.com/article/Intimidation-Is-the-New-Normal/239890>

45. Flaherty, C. (2016, November 22). Being watched. *Inside Higher Ed*. Retrieved from <https://www.insidehighered.com/news/2016/11/22/new-website-seeks-register-professors-accused-liberal-bias-and-anti-american-values>

46. Heterodox Academy condemned the Professor Watchlist. See: HxA Executive Team. (2016, November 24). Heterodox Academy condemns Professor Watchlist. Retrieved from <https://heterodoxacademy.org/heterodox-academy-condemns-professor-watchlist>

47. Middlebrook, H. (2017, November 14). The fascinating, if unreliable, history of hate crime tracking in the US. *CNN*. Retrieved from <https://www.cnn.com/2017/01/05/health/hate-crimes-tracking-history-fbi/index.html>. Middlebrook correctly notes that hate crimes are historically underreported; still, years of decline, followed by a sudden surge in 2015, may not be strictly attributable to changes in accounting methods.

48. FBI: US hate crimes rise for second straight year. (2017, November 13). *BBC News*. Retrieved from <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-us-canada-41975573>

49. Farivar, M. (2017, September 19). Hate crimes rise in major US cities in 2017. *Voice of America*. Retrieved from <https://www.voanews.com/a/hate-crimes-rising-in-us/4034719.html>

50. Alfonseca, K. (2017, August 21). When hate meets hoax. *ProPublica*. Retrieved from <https://www.propublica.org/article/when-hate-meets-hoax>. See also: Soave, R. (2018, January 19). Another hate crime at the University of Maryland turns out to be a hoax. *Reason*. Retrieved from <http://reason.com/blog/2018/01/19/a-second-hate-crime-at-the-university-of>. See also: Gose, B. (1999, January 8). Hate-crime hoaxes unsettle campuses. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <https://www.chronicle.com/article/Hate-Crime-Hoaxes-Unsettle/2836>

51. Suspect in Mizzou threats identified as Lake St. Louis teen. (2015, November 11). *NBC12*. Retrieved from <http://www.nbc12.com/story/30489913/um-police-arrest-suspect-who-made-racist-threats-on-social-media>

52. Bui, L. (2017, October 17). U-Md. student to face hate-crime charge in fatal stabbing on campus. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/local/public-safety/u-md-student-to-face-hate-crime-charge-in-fatal-stabbing-on-campus/2017/10/17/a17bfa1c-b35c-11e7-be94-fabb0f1e9ffb_story.html

53. One charge was later reduced to accessory after the fact. See: Smithson, D. (2017, November 9). Cases continue in shooting after Spencer protest. *Ocala Star-Banner*. Retrieved from <http://www.ocala.com/news/20171109/cases-continue-in-shooting-after-spencer-protest>. See also: Rozsa, L., & Svrluga, S. (2017, October 20). 3 men charged in shooting after white nationalist Richard Spencer's speech in Florida. *Chicago Tribune*. Retrieved from <http://www.chicagotribune.com/news/nationworld/ct-shooting-richard-spencer-speech-20171020-story.html>

54. Student in Trump shirt detained after brandishing knife, saying “Kill all illegals.” (2018, February 16). *The Daily Beast*. Retrieved from <https://www.thedailybeast.com/student-in-trump-shirt-who-brandished-knife-and-said-kill-all-illegals-detained>
55. McWhorter, J. (2008, December 30). Racism in America is over. *Forbes*. Retrieved from https://www.forbes.com/2008/12/30/end-of-racism-oped-cx_jm_1230mcwhorter.html
56. On the sharp drop in Republican trust in universities since 2015, see Pew Research Center (2017, July 10). Sharp partisan divisions in views of national institutions. Retrieved from <http://www.people-press.org/2017/07/10/sharp-partisan-divisions-in-views-of-national-institutions>

Chapter 7: Anxiety and Depression

1. Solomon (2014), p. 110.
2. Novotney (2014).
3. By 2015, 22% of college students were seeking mental health services (10% on some campuses, up to 50% on others). And “54 percent of all college students report[ed] feeling overwhelming anxiety, up from 46.4 percent in 2010.” See Estroff Marano, H. (2015, September 1). Crisis U. *Psychology Today*. Retrieved from <https://www.psychologytoday.com/articles/201509/crisis-u>
4. Levinson-King, R. (2017, March 13). Teen suicide on the rise among Canadian girls. *BBC News*. Retrieved from <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-us-canada-39210463> . See also: Canadian Institute for Health Information. (n.d.). Intentional self-harm among youth in Canada. Retrieved from https://www.cihi.ca/sites/default/files/info_child_harm_en.pdf
5. Sanghani, R. (2017, March 16). Why are so many of Britain’s teen girls struggling with mental health problems? *The Telegraph*. Retrieved from <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/health-fitness/body/why-are-so-many-of-britains-teen-girls-struggling-with-mental-he>. That article refers to a large longitudinal UK study, which can be retrieved here: https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/599871/LSYPE2_w2-research_report.pdf. See also: Pells, R. (2017, July 9). Number of university students claiming special circumstances for mental health problems “soars.” *The Independent*. Retrieved from <http://www.independent.co.uk/news/education/education-news/number-of-university-students-mental-health-problems-illness-claiming-special-circumstances-a7831791.html>
6. Data on trends in the UK and Canada collected in 2018 and 2019 will be crucial for determining whether or not they have the same problem as the USA.
7. Allen, M. (2017, November 9). Sean Parker unloads on Facebook: “God only knows what it’s doing to our children’s brains.” *Axios*. Retrieved from <https://www.axios.com/sean-parker-unloads-on-facebook-god-only-knows-what-its-doing-to-our-childrens-brains-1513306792-f855e7b4-4e99-4d60-8d51-2775559c2671.html>
8. Twenge (2017), chapter 2.
9. Twenge (2017), p. 3
10. See Twenge (2017), Appendix B, Figures B1 and B2. The appendix is online; it can be retrieved at <http://www.jeantwenge.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/igen-appendix.pdf>
11. Twenge (2017), chapter 4. See also: Twenge, Joiner, Rogers, & Martin (2017).
12. In 1994, Nolen-Hoeksema & Girgus (1994) found “no gender differences in depression rates in prepubescent children, but, after the age of 15, girls and women [were] about twice as likely to

be depressed as boys and men.” In a 2017 paper, Salk, Hyde, & Abramson (2017) found that gender differences emerged at twelve years old, which was earlier than had been previously thought.

13. The criteria are that a person reports having at least five out of nine symptoms nearly every day for a two-week period, as described in Hunter & Tice (2016). Retrieved from

<https://www.samhsa.gov/data/sites/default/files/NSDUH-MethodSummDefsHTML-2015/NSDUH-MethodSummDefsHTML-2015/NSDUH-MethodSummDefs-2015.htm#b4-8>

14. Hacking (1991), as described in Haslam (2016).

15. You can download the data and report at <https://www.CDC.gov/injury/wisqars/fatal.html>

16. Levinson-King, R. (2017, March 13). Teen suicide on the rise among Canadian girls.

Retrieved from <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-us-canada-39210463>

17. Office for National Statistics (UK). (2017, December 18). Suicides in the UK: 2016 registrations (point 6: Suicides in the UK by age). Retrieved from

<https://www.ons.gov.uk/peoplepopulationandcommunity/birthsdeathsandmarriages/deaths/bulletins/suicidesintheunitedkingdom/2016registrations#suicides-in-the-uk-by-age>

18. Mercado, Holland, Leemis, Stone, & Wang (2017).

19. Twenge, Joiner, Rogers, & Martin (2018).

20. Vigen, T. (n.d.). Spurious correlations. Retrieved from <http://www.tylervigen.com/spurious-correlations>

21. If children have papers to write, or other homework that requires the use of a computer, that time does not appear to be correlated with depression.

22. Twenge (2017), pp. 82 and 84. For more in-depth analysis, see: Twenge et al. (2018).

23. Twenge discusses the issue of reverse correlation (that is, that depression causes teens to spend more time on screens) and links to studies suggesting that it is not the cause of the association. One of the studies she discusses was a true experiment using random assignment. People who were randomly assigned to give up Facebook for a week reported feeling less depressed at the end of the study. See: Twenge, J. (2017, November 14). With teen mental health deteriorating over five years, there’s a likely culprit. Retrieved from

<https://theconversation.com/with-teen-mental-health-deteriorating-over-five-years-theres-a-likely-culprit-86996>

24. See discussion of eusociality and ultrasociality in Haidt (2012), chapter 9.

25. Twenge, Joiner, Rogers, & Martin (2018), p. 4.

26. Twenge (2017).

27. Twenge (2017).

28. Maccoby (1998).

29. Wood Rudolph, H. (2017, October 11). How women talk: Heather Wood Rudolph interviews Deborah Tannen. *Los Angeles Review of Books*. Retrieved from

<https://lareviewofbooks.org/article/how-women-talk-heather-wood-rudolph-interviews-deborah-tannen>. Twenge echoes Tannen’s concern when she says, “Girls use social media more often, giving them additional opportunities to feel excluded and lonely when they see their friends or classmates getting together without them,” in Twenge (2017, September). Have smartphones

destroyed a generation? *The Atlantic*. Retrieved from

<https://www.theatlantic.com/magazine/archive/2017/09/has-the-smartphone-destroyed-a-generation/534198>

30. Twenge (2017), Appendix F, figure F1. Online appendix can be retrieved from

<http://www.jeantwenge.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/igen-appendix.pdf>

31. Arata, E. (2016, August 1). The unexpected reason Snapchat's "pretty" filters hurt your self-esteem. *Elite Daily*. Retrieved from <https://www.elitedaily.com/wellness/snapchat-filters-self-esteem/1570236>
32. Jowett, V. (2017, July 10). Inside the Snapchat filter surgery boom. *Cosmopolitan*. Retrieved from <http://www.cosmopolitan.com/uk/beauty-hair/a9617028/celebrity-cosmetic-surgery-snapchat-filter-boom>
33. Crick & Grotpeter (1995).
34. For example: Thielking, M. (2017, February 8). Surging demand for mental health care jams college services. *Scientific American*. Retrieved from <https://www.scientificamerican.com/article/surging-demand-for-mental-health-care-jams-college-services>. See also: Peterson, A. (2016, October 10). Students flood college mental-health centers. *The Wall Street Journal*. Retrieved from <http://www.wsj.com/articles/students-flood-college-mental-health-centers-1476120902>. See also: Tugend, A. (2017, June 7). Colleges get proactive in addressing depression on campus. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/06/07/education/colleges-get-proactive-in-addressing-depression-on-campus.html>
35. Center for Collegiate Mental Health, Pennsylvania State University. (2016). 2016 annual report. Retrieved from https://sites.psu.edu/ccmh/files/2017/01/2016-Annual-Report-FINAL_2016_01_09-1gc2hj6.pdf
36. Higher Education Institute (HERI). The question was only added in 2010, and is asked only every other year. The exact question wording is: "Do you have any of the following disabilities or medical conditions? (Mark Yes or No for each item.)" The survey then lists seven different types of disabilities and conditions, including "Psychological disorder (depression, etc.)" with the option to select "Yes" or "No" for each. Survey instruments and data can be accessed at <https://heri.ucla.edu/heri-data-archive>
37. Reetz, D. R., Bershada, C., LeViness, P., & Whitlock, M. (2017). The Association for University and College Counseling Center Directors annual survey. Retrieved from <https://www.aucccd.org/assets/documents/aucccd%202016%20monograph%20-%20public.pdf>. See also summary and graph in: Tate, E. (2017, March 29). Anxiety on the rise. *Inside Higher Ed*. Retrieved from <https://www.insidehighered.com/news/2017/03/29/anxiety-and-depression-are-primary-concerns-students-seeking-counseling-services>
38. One study at a diverse, urban university found that 38% of the students in the study reported a history of deliberately self-harming at least once, 18% reported having intentionally self-harmed at least ten times, and 10% reported having deliberately self-harmed more than 100 times. Gratz, Conrad, & Roeter (2002). See also appendix F in the online appendices for Twenge (2017); Twenge offers additional graphs showing mental health outcomes from the American College Health Association Survey and the Youth Risk Behavior Surveillance System. The appendices can be retrieved from <http://www.jeantwenge.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/igen-appendix.pdf>
39. Zhiguo & Fang (2014).
40. Shin & Liberzon (2010).
41. Gotlib & Joormann (2010).
42. Prociuk, Breen, & Lussier. (1976). See also: Costello (1982).
43. Peterson, Maier, & Seligman (1993). See also: Seligman (1990).
44. Chen, Cocco, & Jacobson (2012).

45. Clark, Algoe, & Green (2018).

Chapter 8: Paranoid Parenting

1. Denizet-Lewis, B. (2017, October 11). Why are more American teenagers than ever suffering from severe anxiety? *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/10/11/magazine/why-are-more-american-teenagers-than-ever-suffering-from-severe-anxiety.html>
2. Skenazy, L. (2008, April 1). Why I let my 9-year-old ride the subway alone. *The New York Sun*. Retrieved from <http://www.nysun.com/opinion/why-i-let-my-9-year-old-ride-subway-alone/73976>
3. Skenazy, L. (2015, January 16). I let my 9- year-old ride the subway alone. I got labeled the “World’s Worst Mom.” *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/posteverything/wp/2015/01/16/i-let-my-9-year-old-ride-the-subway-alone-i-got-labeled-the-worlds-worst-mom/?utm_term=.7cbce60ca0e0
4. The main suspect in the case was not convicted until 2017. For a summary, see: McKinley, J. C. (2017, April 18). Pedro Hernandez gets 25 years to life in murder of Etan Patz. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/04/18/nyregion/pedro-hernandez-etan-patz-sentencing.html>
5. Lafrance, A. (2017, February 14). When bad news was printed on milk cartons. *The Atlantic*. Retrieved from <https://www.theatlantic.com/technology/archive/2017/02/when-bad-news-was-printed-on-milk-cartons/516675>
6. National Crime Information Center. (n.d.) 2016 NCIC missing person and unidentified person statistics. Retrieved from <https://www.fbi.gov/file-repository/2016-ncic-missing-person-and-unidentified-person-statistics.pdf/view>
7. Polly Klaas Foundation. (n.d.). National child kidnapping facts. Retrieved from <http://www.pollyklaas.org/about/national-child-kidnapping.html>
8. ChildStats.gov. (n.d.). POP1 Child population: Number of children (in millions) ages 0–17 in the United States by age, 1950–2016 and projected 2017–2050. Retrieved from <https://www.childstats.gov/americaschildren/tables/pop1.asp>
9. Simpson, K. (2010, November 27). Dispelled kidnap myths do little to allay parents’ fears. *The Denver Post*. Retrieved from <http://www.denverpost.com/2010/11/27/dispelled-kidnap-myths-do-little-to-allay-parents-fears>
10. For more on kidnapping trends, see: U.S. Department of Justice. (2016, June 14). Number of child abductions by strangers unchanged over past decade and a half; Fewer end in homicide. Retrieved from <http://www.unh.edu/ccrc/Presspacket/Stereotypical%20Kidnapping%20.pdf> . Three interesting points: (1) Ninety-two percent of kidnapped children were returned safely to their families in 2011, compared with just 57% in 1997. (Technology, such as cell phone tracking, has been a big help to law enforcement.) (2) Four out of five children abducted by a stranger in 2011 did not live in a home with two parents (biological or adoptive). (3) One third of the children abducted were never reported missing. No adult was taking responsibility for them; they were kids who fell through the cracks. See: Flores, J. R. (2002, October). Nonfamily abducted children: National estimates and characteristics. Retrieved from <http://www.pollyklaas.org/media/pdf/NISMARTIIInonfamily.pdf>

11. FBI Criminal Justice Information Services Division. (n.d.). Preliminary semiannual uniform crime report, January–June, 2015. Retrieved from <https://ucr.fbi.gov/crime-in-the-u.s/2015/preliminary-semiannual-uniform-crime-report-januaryjune-2015>
12. Kurutz, S. (2004, October 24). The age of the mugger. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.nytimes.com/2004/10/24/nyregion/thecity/the-age-of-the-mugger.html>
13. At least, of missing white children. From 1979 to 1981, there was a horrific cluster of more than twenty-five fatal kidnappings of black children in Atlanta that became known as the Atlanta Child Murders. This killing spree garnered less national attention than the murders of Patz and Walsh, which occurred during those years.
14. There is no consensus among criminologists as to why crime went down so quickly all across America. Jon believes that the phaseout of leaded gasoline in the late 1970s and early 1980s is one major factor. See: Drum, K. (2016, February 11). Lead: America’s real criminal element. *Mother Jones*. Retrieved from <http://www.motherjones.com/environment/2016/02/lead-exposure-gasoline-crime-increase-children-health>
15. Infoplease. (n.d.) Homicide rate per 100,000, 1950–2015. Retrieved from <https://www.infoplease.com/us/crime/homicide-rate-1950-2014>
16. Stapleton, A. C. (2015, February 6). Police: 6- year-old boy “kidnapped” for being too nice to strangers. *CNN*. Retrieved from <http://www.cnn.com/2015/02/05/us/missouri-fake-kidnapping/index.html>
17. Berchelmann, K. (2017, May 4). When can my child use the public restroom alone? *HealthyChildren.org*. Retrieved from <https://www.healthychildren.org/English/tips-tools/ask-the-pediatrician/Pages/When-can-my-child-use-the-public-restroom-alone.aspx>
18. Lowbrow, Y. (2014, June 9). 8 reasons children of the 1970s should all be dead. Retrieved from <https://flashbak.com/8-reasons-children-of-the-1970s-should-all-be-dead-323>
19. YOURS News. (2012, February 20). Seatbelts—Saving thousands of lives around the world everyday . . . [Blog post]. Retrieved from <http://www.youthforroadsafety.org/news-blog/news-blog-item/t/seatbelts-saving-thousands-of-lives-around-the-world-everyday>
20. Ganti et al. (2013).
21. DeNoon, D. J. (2003, May 13). Quit smoking so your kids won’t start. *Web MD*. Retrieved from <https://www.webmd.com/smoking-cessation/news/20030513/quit-smoking-so-your-kids-wont-start>
22. National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health. (n.d.). LEAD: Information for workers—Health problems caused by lead. Retrieved from <https://www.cdc.gov/niosh/topics/lead/health.html>
23. Christakis (2016), p. 131.
24. Taleb (2007).
25. For more on these backfire effects, see Greg Ip’s perfectly titled book *Foolproof: Why Safety Can Be Dangerous and How Danger Makes Us Safe*. Ip (2015).
26. Skenazy (2008); see n. 2.
27. J. Lythcott-Haims (personal communication May 26, 2017).
28. Estroff Marano, H. (2004, November 1). A nation of wimps. *Psychology Today*. Retrieved from <https://www.psychologytoday.com/articles/200411/nation-wimps>
29. J. Lythcott-Haims (personal communication May 26, 2017).
30. This is called the demographic transition. See: Grover, D. (2014, October 13). What is the Demographic Transition Model? *PopEd Blog*. Retrieved from <http://www.populationeducation.org/content/what-demographic-transition-model>

31. Parker, K., & Wang, W. (2013, March 14). Modern parenthood: Roles of moms and dads converge as they balance work and family. *Pew Research Center*. Retrieved from <http://www.pewsocialtrends.org/2013/03/14/modern-parenthood-roles-of-moms-and-dads-converge-as-they-balance-work-and-family>
32. L. Skenazy (personal communication, May 4, 2017).
33. Skenazy, L. (2015, June 11). 11- year-old boy played in his yard. CPS took him, felony charge for parents. *Reason*. Retrieved from <http://reason.com/blog/2015/06/11/11-year-old-boy-played-in-his-yard-cps-t>
34. WFSB Staff. (2014, July 9). Bristol mother charged with leaving child unattended in car. *Eyewitness News 3*. Retrieved from <http://wfsb.com/story/25982048/bristol-mother-charged-with-leaving-child-unattended-in-car>. (For more stories like this, visit <https://letgrow.org/blog>)
35. Skenazy, L. (2016, June 17) “16 is the appropriate age to allow children to be outside by themselves”—New Albany, Ohio, police chief. *Free-Range Kids*. Retrieved from <http://www.freerangekids.com/16-is-the-appropriate-age-to-allow-children-to-be-outside-by-themselves-new-albany-ohio-police-chief>
36. Lareau (2011), p. 3.
37. Putnam (2015), p. 117.
38. Putnam (2015), p. 117.
39. DeLoache et al. (2010).
40. The website for the research project is hosted by the Centers for Disease Control, at <http://www.cdc.gov/violenceprevention/acestudy>
41. Putnam (2015), p.112.
42. Chetty, Friedman, Saez, Turner, & Yagen (2017). See a summary of that paper in this infographic: Some colleges have more students from the top 1 percent than the bottom 60. Find yours. (2017, January 18). *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2017/01/18/upshot/some-colleges-have-more-students-from-the-top-1-percent-than-the-bottom-60.html>
43. L. Skenazy (personal communication, May 4, 2017).

Chapter 9: The Decline of Play

1. LaFreniere (2011).
2. LaFreniere (2011), p. 479, asserts that “[i]n games involving chasing, children seem to prefer the fleeing position (e.g., in the game of tag and in all games modeled after tag, the preferred position is to be chased), which suggests that such play has more to do with our legacy as prey than our legacy as hunters.”
3. LaFreniere (2011), p. 465. See also: Sandseter & Kennair (2011). See also: Gray, P. (2014, April 7). Risky play: Why children love it and need it. *Psychology Today*. Retrieved from <https://www.psychologytoday.com/blog/freedom-learn/201404/risky-play-why-children-love-it-and-need-it>
4. Einon, Morgan, & Kibbler (1978). See also: Hol, Berg, Ree, & Spruijt (1999) for another experimental study with rat pups, and see Mustoe, Taylor, Birnie, Huffman, & French (2014) for a correlational study with marmosets. See a review of this literature in Gray (in press).
5. Black, Jones, Nelson, & Greenough (1998).

6. Johnson & Newport (1989). For a review of the famous case of the feral child “Genie,” see Curtiss (1977). For deaf children things work the same way, with signs. Spoken words are not essential, but communication with others is.
7. This, at least, is the argument made by many researchers who study play, including Gray (in press), LaFreniere (2011), and Sandseter & Kennair (2011). We note that there is no direct experimental proof of this strong version of the claim—that play deprivation in childhood will alter adult personality. Controlled experiments such as the ones we described with rat pups can never be done with humans. In the rest of this chapter, we show why we think the claim is plausible and likely to be true.
8. Gray (2011). See also: Gray (in press).
9. Sandseter & Kennair (2011), p. 275.
10. Gray (2011), p. 444.
11. Singer, Singer, D’Agostino, & DeLong (2009), cited in Gray (2011).
12. Hirsh-Pasek, Golinkoff, Berk, & Singer (2009).
13. Gray (2011), p. 456.
14. Hofferth & Sandberg (2001), cited in Gray (2011).
15. As shown by mediation analyses in Twenge et al. (2018), which found that all forms of screen time are associated with negative mental health outcomes. Peter Gray, however, takes a more positive view of social interaction mediated by screens. He believes that it is real social interaction, and that multiplayer video games are a form of play. He also notes that online social interaction has the advantage of occurring, typically, without any adult supervision. He agrees, however, that online interaction lacks the benefits of vigorous physical play and that some forms of online interaction may turn out to be harmful to mental health. P. Gray (personal communication, February 8, 2018).
16. Hofferth & Sandberg (2001).
17. See review in Shumaker, H. (2016, March 5). Homework is wrecking our kids: The research is clear, let’s ban elementary homework. *Salon*. Retrieved from https://www.salon.com/2016/03/05/homework_is_wrecking_our_kids_the_research_is_clear_let_s_ban_elementary_homework. See also: Marzano, R., & Pickering, D. (2007, March). Special topic: The case for and against homework. *Educational Leadership*, 64(6), 74–79. Retrieved from <https://www.lincnet.org/cms/lib05/MA01001239/Centricity/Domain/108/Homework.pdf>. See also: Cooper, Lindsay, Nye, & Greathouse (1998). See also: Cooper, Civey Robinson, & Patall (2006). See also: Cooper, Steenbergen-Hu, & Dent (2012).
18. “In the last 20 years, homework has increased only in the lower grade levels, and this increase is associated with neutral (and sometimes negative) effects on student achievement.” National Education Association. (n.d.). Research spotlight on homework. Retrieved from <http://www.nea.org/tools/16938.htm>
19. L. Skenazy (personal communication, January 23, 2018).
20. Clements (2004), cited in Gray (2011).
21. Whitley, C. (2011, August 1). Is your child ready for first grade: 1979 edition. *ChicagoNow*. Retrieved from <http://www.chicagonow.com/little-kids-big-city/2011/08/is-your-child-ready-for-first-grade-1979-edition>. (We thank Erika Chistakis for pointing it out to us.)
22. Whitley (2011); see n. 21.

23. St. Theresa's Catholic School (Austin, TX). (2012, January). Expectations for incoming first graders. Retrieved from https://www.st-theresa.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/02/1st_Expectations.pdf
24. E. Christakis (personal communication, October 21, 2017).
25. Christakis (2016).
26. Gopnik, A. (2011, March 16). Why preschool shouldn't be like school: New research shows that teaching kids more and more, at ever-younger ages, may backfire. Slate. Retrieved from http://www.slate.com/articles/double_x/doublex/2011/03/why_preschool_shouldnt_be_like_school.html. See also: Gray, P. (2015, May 5). Early academic training produces long-term harm. *Psychology Today*. Retrieved from <https://www.psychologytoday.com/blog/freedom-learn/201505/early-academic-training-produces-long-term-harm>
27. Bassok, Latham, & Rorem (2016).
28. Common Core State Standards Initiative. (n.d.). Introduction to Common Core. Retrieved from <http://www.corestandards.org/Math/Content/introduction>
29. Common Core State Standards Initiative. (n.d.). English language arts standards » Reading: Foundational skills » Kindergarten. Retrieved from <http://www.corestandards.org/ELA-Literacy/RF/K>
30. E. Christakis (personal communication, June 2, 2017).
31. "Ironically, when today's kindergarten and first-grade teachers are asked to name the school-readiness skills most important for preschoolers to master, they invariably still rank social and emotional skills, such as being able to take turns or listen to a friend, above pre-academic skills, such as number and letter identification. But parents often see things very differently." Christakis (2016), p. 7.
32. Pew Research Center. (2015, December 17). Parenting in America: Children's extracurricular activities. Retrieved from <http://www.pewsocialtrends.org/2015/12/17/5-childrens-extracurricular-activities>
33. Mose (2016).
34. Scholarship America. (2011, August 25). Make your extracurricular activities pay off. *U.S. News & World Report*. Retrieved from <https://www.usnews.com/education/blogs/the-scholarship-coach/2011/08/25/make-your-extracurricular-activities-pay-off>
35. Princeton Review. (n.d.). 14 summer activities to boost your college application. Retrieved from <https://www.princetonreview.com/college-advice/summer-activities-for-college-applications>
36. Yale University Office of Institutional Research. (2016, November 30). Summary of Yale College admissions class of 1986 to class of 2020. Retrieved from https://oir.yale.edu/sites/default/files/w033_fresh_admissions.pdf
37. Deresiewicz (2015), p. 39.
38. J. Lythcott-Haims (personal communication, May 26, 2017). As Lenore Skenazy put it, these parents "are stalked by the twin fears that their children will be kidnapped . . . or not get into Harvard." L. Skenazy (personal communication, January 23, 2018).
39. Morrison, P. (2015, October 28). How "helicopter parenting" is ruining America's children. *Los Angeles Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.latimes.com/opinion/op-ed/la-oe-morrison-lythcott-haims-20151028-column.html>
40. A. Duckworth (personal communication, March 19, 2018).
41. Bruni, F. (2016, January 19). Rethinking college admissions. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2016/01/20/opinion/rethinking-college-admissions.html>

42. Rosin, H. (2015, November 20). The Silicon Valley suicides. *The Atlantic*. Retrieved from <https://www.theatlantic.com/magazine/archive/2015/12/the-silicon-valley-suicides/413140>
43. Spencer, K. (2017, April 5). It takes a suburb: A town struggles to ease student stress. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/04/05/education/edlife/overachievers-student-stress-in-high-school-.html? r=0>
44. Farrell, A., McDevitt, J., & Austin, R. (2015). Youth risk behavior survey Lexington High School—2015 results: Executive summary. Retrieved from <https://lps.lexingtonma.org/cms/lib2/MA01001631/Centricity/Domain/547/YRBSLHSExecSummary08Mar16.pdf>. See also: Luthar & Latendresse (2005). See also: Chawla, I., & Njoo, L. (2016, July 21). CDC releases preliminary findings on Palo Alto suicide clusters. *The Stanford Daily*. Retrieved from <https://www.stanforddaily.com/2016/07/21/cdc-releases-preliminary-findings-on-palo-alto-suicide-clusters>
45. Chetty, Friedman, Saez, Turner, & Yagen (2017). See a summary of that paper in this infographic: Some colleges have more students from the top 1 percent than the bottom 60. Find yours. (2017, January 18). *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2017/01/18/upshot/some-colleges-have-more-students-from-the-top-1-percent-than-the-bottom-60.html>
46. Quoted in Brody, J. E. (2015, January 19). Parenting advice from “America’s worst mom.” *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://well.blogs.nytimes.com/2015/01/19/advice-from-america-s-worst-mom>
47. Horwitz (2015).
48. Ostrom, E. (1990).
49. Ostrom, V. (1997).
50. Horwitz (2015), p. 10.
51. Iyengar & Krupenkin (2018).
52. Ortiz-Ospina, E., & Roser, M. (2017). Trust. Retrieved from <https://ourworldindata.org/trust>
53. Horwitz (2015), p. 3.
54. We note that this advice is less needed for students from less privileged backgrounds, who are more likely to experience unfairness and “bad luck” as a normal part of life.
55. Reilly, K. (2017, July 5). “I wish you bad luck.” Read Supreme Court Justice John Roberts’ unconventional speech to his son’s graduating class. *Time*. Retrieved from <http://time.com/4845150/chief-justice-john-roberts-commencement-speech-transcript>

Chapter 10: The Bureaucracy of Safetyism

1. De Tocqueville (1839/2012), book 4, chapter 6.
2. FIRE letter to Northern Michigan University, August 25, 2016. (2016, September 19). Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/fire-letter-to-northern-michigan-university-august-25-2016>
3. THE “I CARE PROJECT”: Revise NMU Student Self-Destructive Behavior Policy. (n.d.). *Change.org* [Petition]. Retrieved from <https://www.change.org/p/northern-michigan-university-the-i-care-project-revise-nmu-student-self-destructive-behavior-policy>

4. Singal, J. (2016, September 22). A university threatened to punish students who discussed their suicidal thoughts with friends (Updated). *The Cut*. Retrieved from <https://www.thecut.com/2016/09/a-school-is-threatening-to-punish-its-suicidal-students.html>. Northern Michigan has since revised its policy; it no longer sends that letter, and by January 2016, it stopped prohibiting students from discussing self-harm with peers. See: Northern Michigan University. (2016). Northern Michigan University practice concerning self-destructive students changed January 2016. Retrieved from <http://www.nmu.edu/mc/current-mental-health-communication>
5. National Center for Educational Statistics (1993), p. 64.
6. Fast Facts: Back to School Statistics. (n.d.). *National Center for Education Statistics*. Retrieved from <https://nces.ed.gov/fastfacts/display.asp?id=372>
7. Digest of Education Statistics. (2016). Tables 333.10 (Revenues of public institutions) and (333.40) (Revenues of private institutions). *National Center for Education Statistics*. Retrieved from https://nces.ed.gov/programs/digest/current_tables.asp
8. Gross Domestic Product 2016. (2017, December 15). *World Bank Development Indicators Database*. Retrieved from <https://databank.worldbank.org/data/download/GDP.pdf>
9. Digest of Education Statistics. (2016). Table 333.90 (Endowments). *National Center for Education Statistics*. Retrieved from https://nces.ed.gov/programs/digest/d16/tables/dt16_333.90.asp?current=yes
10. Of the top twenty-five universities as listed by Times Higher Education, the percentage of international students ranges from 16% at the University of Michigan to 45% at Carnegie Mellon. World University Rankings 2018. *Times Higher Education*. Retrieved from https://www.timeshighereducation.com/world-university-rankings/2018/world-ranking#!/page/0/length/25/sort_by/rank/sort_order/asc/cols/stats
11. World University Rankings 2018; see n. 10. Or perhaps it is nineteen of the top twenty-five. See also: Best Global Universities Rankings. (2018). *U.S. News & World Report*. Retrieved from <https://www.usnews.com/education/best-global-universities/rankings>
12. Kerr (1963).
13. “Universities’ executive, administrative, and managerial offices grew 15 percent during the recession, even as budgets were cut and tuition was increased.” Marcus, J. (2016, October 6). The reason behind colleges’ ballooning bureaucracies. *The Atlantic*. Retrieved from <https://www.theatlantic.com/education/archive/2016/10/ballooning-bureaucracies-shrinking-checkbooks/503066>
14. See, for example, Catropa, D., & Andrews, M. (2013, February 8). Bemoaning the corporatization of higher education. *Inside Higher Ed*. Retrieved from <https://www.insidehighered.com/blogs/strategy/bemoaning-corporatization-higher-education>
15. “Since 1975, according to a 2014 report from the American Association of University Professors, full-time administrative positions grew by 369 percent, whereas full-time tenure-track faculty grew by 23 percent and part-time faculty by 286 percent.” Braswell, S. (2016, April 24). The fightin’ administrators: The birth of a college bureaucracy. *Point Taken*. Retrieved from <http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/point-taken/blog/ozy-fightin-administrators-birth-college-bureaucracy>. See also: Christensen, K. (2015, October 17). Is UC spending too little on teaching, too much on administration? *Los Angeles Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.latimes.com/local/education/la-me-uc-spending-20151011-story.html>

16. Campos, P. F. (2015, April 4). The real reason college tuition costs so much. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2015/04/05/opinion/sunday/the-real-reason-college-tuition-costs-so-much.html>
17. Catropa & Andrews (2013); see n. 15. See also: Lewis (2007), pp. 4–5. See also: McArdle, M. (2015, August 13). Sheltered students go to college, avoid education. *Bloomberg View*. Retrieved from <https://www.bloomberg.com/view/articles/2015-08-13/sheltered-students-go-to-college-avoid-education>
18. Ginsberg (2011). Chapter 1, section “Shared Governance?” paragraphs 2–6.
19. Ginsberg (2011). Chapter 1, section “Professors and Administrators?” paragraph 16.
20. In one of the very few exceptions we know of, Oberlin president Marvin Krislov refused to accept a list of “non negotiable” demands. See Jaschik, S. (2016, January 21). Oberlin’s president says no. *Inside Higher Ed*. Retrieved from <https://www.insidehighered.com/news/2016/01/21/oberlins-president-refuses-negotiate-student-list-demands>
21. Adler, E. (2018, March 15). Students think they can suppress speech because colleges treat them like customers. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from http://wapo.st/2phMwCB?tid=ss_tw&utm_term=.75b5e44fa1d0
22. See figure 5 on page 11 of Desrochers, D. M., & Hurlburt, S. (2016, January). Trends in college spending: 2003–2013. American Institutes for Research. *Delta Cost Project*. Retrieved from <https://www.deltacostproject.org/sites/default/files/products/15-4626%20Final01%20Delta%20Cost%20Project%20College%20Spending%2011131.406.P0.02.001%20...pdf>
23. Carlson, S. (2013, January 28). What’s the payoff for the “country club” college? *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <https://www.chronicle.com/blogs/buildings/whats-the-payoff-for-the-country-club-college/32477>. See also: College Ranker. (n.d.). Colleges as country clubs: Today’s pampered college students. Retrieved from <http://www.collegeranker.com/features/colleges-as-country-clubs>. See also: Jacob, B., McCall, B. & Stange, K. M. (2013, January). College as country club: Do colleges cater to students’ preferences for consumption? *National Bureau of Economic Research*. Retrieved from <http://www.nber.org/papers/w18745.pdf>. Forbes poked fun at the practice by comparing colleges and country clubs to “Club Fed” minimum-security correctional facilities. Pierce, K. (2014, July 29). College, country club or prison? *Forbes*. Retrieved from <https://www.forbes.com/special-report/2014/country-college-prison.html>
24. A 2013 survey by NIRSA (formerly the National Intramural-Recreational Sports Association) found ninety-two schools with pending recreation center projects totaling \$1.7 billion. Cited in Rubin, C. (2014, September 19). Making a splash: College recreation now includes pool parties and river rides. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2014/09/21/fashion/college-recreation-now-includes-pool-parties-and-river-rides.html>. See also: Koch, J. V. (2018, January 9). Opinion: No college kid needs a water park to study. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/01/09/opinion/trustees-tuition-lazy-rivers.html>
25. Stripling, J. (2017, October 15). The lure of the lazy river. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <https://www.chronicle.com/article/The-Lure-of-the-Lazy-River/241434>

26. *Papish v. Bd. of Curators of the Univ. of Missouri et al.*, 410 U.S. 667 (1973) (reinstating a student expelled for distributing an underground student newspaper with an offensive cartoon and headline); *Texas v. Johnson*, 491 U.S. 397 (1989) (flag burning).
27. For simplicity, we'll use the term "administrators" to include those who run the university, and all the deans and offices that have anything to do with student life. This includes much (but not all of) the professional staff on campus other than the faculty—generally the people students mean when they talk about "the administration" of a university.
28. Greg's first book, *Unlearning Liberty* (Lukianoff 2014), covering campuses from around 2001 to 2012, presents dozens of examples of administrators overreacting.
29. After placing the professor on leave and forcing him to undergo a psychiatric evaluation, the college eventually rescinded its punishment. See: Victory: College backtracks after punishing professor for "Game of Thrones" picture. (2014, October 28). *FIRE*. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/victory-college-backtracks-punishing-professor-game-thrones-picture>
30. College declares Haymarket Riot reference a violent threat to college president. (2015, June 8). *FIRE*. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/college-declares-haymarket-riot-reference-a-violent-threat-to-college-president>. FIRE sent two letters to Oakton, but nothing further occurred in this case; the school didn't retract its cease-and-desist letter, but no formal action was taken against the professor.
31. Harris, S. (2016, September 1). Speech code of the month: Drexel University. *FIRE*. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/speech-code-of-the-month-drexel-university>
32. FIRE rates colleges' speech codes as "red light," "yellow light," or "green light." (FIRE's speech code ratings are explained in full at <https://www.thefire.org/spotlight/using-the-spotlight-database>.) The University of West Alabama's "red light" policies are still in effect, including the ban on harsh text messages or insults. Jacksonville State's speech codes have changed over the years; most recently in 2017. It now has an overall yellow light rating. You can see which colleges are rated as red, yellow, or green at <https://www.thefire.org/spotlight>. See also: (n.d.). Spotlight: Jacksonville State University. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/schools/jacksonville-state-university>. See also: (n.d.). Spotlight: University of West Alabama. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/schools/university-of-west-alabama>
33. Harris, S. (2009, May 29). McNeese State revises "public forum" policy but still prohibits "derogatory" speech. *FIRE*. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/mcneese-state-revises-public-forum-policy-but-still-prohibits-derogatory-speech>
34. *Univ. of Cincinnati Chapter of Young Americans for Liberty v. Williams*, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 80967 (S.D. Ohio June 12, 2012).
35. You can see a wide variety of campus codes at: Spotlight Database and Activism Portal. (2018). *FIRE*. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/spotlight>
36. In the fifteen years between September 12, 2001, and December 31, 2016, there were eighty-five "violent extremist" attacks in the United States, an average of less than half a dozen per year. Valverde, M. (2017, August 16). A look at the data on domestic terrorism and who's behind it. *PolitiFact*. Retrieved from <http://www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/article/2017/aug/16/look-data-domestic-terrorism-and-whos-behind-it>
37. The webpage listed on the signs explains: "The New York University Bias Response Line provides a mechanism through which members of our community can share or report experiences and concerns of bias, discrimination, or harassing behavior that may occur within

- our community.” NYU Bias Response Line. (n.d.). Retrieved from <http://www.nyu.edu/about/policies-guidelines-compliance/equal-opportunity/bias-response.html>
38. FIRE. (2017). 2017 Report on Bias Reporting Systems. [Blog post]. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/first-amendment-library/special-collections/fire-guides/report-on-bias-reporting-systems-2017>
39. See a review of such biases in Haidt (2006), chapter 2.
40. See Pappano, L. (2017, October 31). In a volatile climate on campus, professors teach on tenterhooks. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/10/31/education/edlife/liberal-teaching-amid-partisan-divide.html>. See also: Belkin, D. (2017, February 27). College faculty’s new focus: Don’t offend. *The Wall Street Journal*. Retrieved from <https://www.wsj.com/articles/college-facultys-new-focus-dont-offend-1488200404>
41. Suk Gersen, J. (2014, December 15). The trouble with teaching rape law. *The New Yorker*. Retrieved from <https://www.newyorker.com/news/news-desk/trouble-teaching-rape-law>
42. Steinbaugh, A. (2016, July 7). University of Northern Colorado defends, modifies “Bias Response Team” as criticism mounts and recording emerges. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/university-of-northern-colorado-bias-response-team-recording-emerges>
43. Melchior, J.K. (2016, July 5). Exclusive: Transcript of bias response team conversation with censored professor. *Heat Street* (via Archive.org). Retrieved from <https://web.archive.org/web/20160805130848/https://heatst.com/culture-wars/exclusive-transcript-of-bias-response-team-conversation-with-censored-professor>
44. Note that this is very similar to the case of Lindsay Shepherd at Wilfrid Laurier University in Canada. Shepherd showed a clip from a televised debate without condemning, in advance, one of the sides of the debate. It can be risky to stage a debate in class if any student feels strongly that one side is correct. See: Grinberg, R. (2017, November 23). Lindsay Shepherd and the potential for heterodoxy at Wilfrid Laurier University. Heterodox Academy. Retrieved from <https://heterodoxacademy.org/lindsay-shepherd-and-the-potential-for-heterodoxy-at-wilfrid-laurier-university>
45. As FIRE’s Adam Steinbaugh notes, “academic freedom chilled politely is still academic freedom chilled.” See: Steinbaugh, A. (2016, July 7); see note 2.
46. Or sometimes not well intended. Given the political dynamics of many campuses, which we described in chapters 4 and 5, bias response tools can easily be used in malicious ways. In the early days of these systems, in 2009, one of the students who worked on the Bias Response Team at California Polytechnic State University admitted in an interview that one target of the system would be the “teacher who isn’t politically correct or is hurtful in their actions or words.” In a case at John Carroll University, several students used the school’s bias response apparatus to target one student in what appeared to be a prank. See: Cal Poly suspends reporting on “politically incorrect” faculty and students. (2009, June 1). *FIRE*. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/cal-poly-suspends-reporting-on-politically-incorrect-faculty-and-students-2>.
- See also: John Carroll University. (2015, December). Bias reports 2014–2015. Retrieved from <http://webmedia.jcu.edu/diversity/files/2015/12/2014-2015-Bias-Report-web-version.pdf>
47. 20 U.S.C. § 1681 et seq. (1972).
48. See *Davis v. Monroe County Board of Education*, 526 U.S. 629, 633 (1999); *Bryant v. Indep. Sch. Dist. No. 1-38*, 334 F.3d 928, 934 (10th Cir. 2003).

49. Civil Rights Act of 1964 § 7, 42 U.S.C. § 2000e-2 (a)(1) & (2) (1964) (prohibiting discrimination in hiring or workplace on the basis of “race, color, religion, sex, or national origin”); Education Amendments of 1972 § 9, 20 U.S.C. § 1681(a) (1972) (prohibiting discrimination in education “on the basis of sex”).
50. Student wins Facebook.com case at University of Central Florida. (2006, March 6). *FIRE*. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/student-wins-facebookcom-case-at-university-of-central-florida>
51. Note that a school can and should use a very low threshold for making support or counseling services available for anyone who feels harassed. The bar for punishing speakers accused of saying something harassing should be higher. Under Title IX, for example, a reported victim is entitled to ameliorative steps before, and even without, a determination of wrongdoing by the accused. The mistake, we believe, is to conflate the two, such that if one person feels offended by a one-off speech act, another person should generally be charged with harassment. A school that makes such a conflation is codifying and teaching the Untruth of Emotional Reasoning and encouraging moral dependence.
52. Janitor/student Keith John Sampson received a letter informing him that he had been found guilty of racial harassment for “openly reading the book related to a historically and racially abhorrent subject.” Lukianoff, G. (2008, May 2). Judging a book by its cover—literally. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/judging-a-book-by-its-cover-literally-3>
53. For examples, see Gluckman, N., Read B., Mangan, K. & Qulantan, B. (2017, November 3). Sexual harassment and assault in higher ed: What’s happened since Weinstein. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <https://www.chronicle.com/article/Sexual-HarassmentAssault/241757>; Anderson, M.D. (2017, October 19). How campus racism could affect black students’ college enrollment. *The Atlantic*. Retrieved from <https://www.theatlantic.com/education/archive/2017/10/how-racism-could-affect-black-students-college-enrollment/543360/>; Berteaux, A. (2016, September 15). In the safe spaces on campus, no Jews allowed. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/acts-of-faith/wp/2016/09/15/in-the-safe-spaces-on-campus-no-jews-allowed/?utm_term=.2bb76389a248
54. Silverglate, H. A. (1999, January 26). Memorandum to free speech advocates, University of Wisconsin. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/memorandum-to-free-speech-advocates-university-of-wisconsin>
55. *Doe v. University of Michigan*, 721 F.Supp. 852, 865 (E.D. Mich. 1989).
56. *Corry v. Leland Stanford Junior University*, No. 740309 (Cal. Super. Ct. Feb. 27, 1995) (slip op.).
57. Bhargava, A., & Jackson, G. (2013, May 9). Letter to President Royce Engstrom and University Counsel Lucy France, Esq., University of Montana. U.S. Department of Justice, Civil Rights Division, & U.S. Department of Education, Office for Civil Rights. Retrieved from <https://www.justice.gov/sites/default/files/opa/legacy/2013/05/09/um-ltr-findings.pdf>
58. Kipnis, L. (2015, February 27). Sexual paranoia strikes academe. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <https://www.chronicle.com/article/Sexual-Paranoia-Strikes/190351>
59. During the investigation, Kipnis was told she could not involve a lawyer; she could not record her meetings with investigators; and, initially, she was told she would not even be informed of the charges against her until she attended the meetings. Cooke, R. (2017, April 2). Sexual paranoia on campus—and the professor at the eye of the storm. *The Guardian*. Retrieved

from <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/apr/02/unwanted-advances-on-campus-us-university-professor-laura-kipnis-interview>

60. Title IX Coordinating Committee response to online petition and ASG resolution. (2014, March 4). *Northwestern Now*. Retrieved from

<https://news.northwestern.edu/stories/2014/03/title-ix-coordinating-committee-response-to-online-petition-and-asg-resolution>

61. Suk Gersen, J. (2017, September 20). Laura Kipnis's endless trial by Title IX. *The New Yorker*. Retrieved from <https://www.newyorker.com/news/news-desk/laura-kipniss-endless-trial-by-title-ix>

62. A defamation suit filed against Kipnis by a student continues. Meisel, H. (2018, March 7). HarperCollins can't escape suit over prof's assault book. *Law360*. Retrieved from

<https://www.law360.com/articles/1019571/harpercollins-can-t-escape-suit-over-prof-s-assault-book>

63. FIRE (Producer). (2016, April 6). In her own words: Laura Kipnis' "Title IX inquisition" at Northwestern [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://youtu.be/vVGOp0IffOQ?t=8m58s>

64. Campbell & Manning (2014). See also their expansion of this work in Campbell & Manning (2018).

65. Campbell & Manning (2014), p. 695.

66. Campbell & Manning (2014), p. 697.

67. Read the email from Erika Christakis here: FIRE (2015, October 30). Email from Erika Christakis: "Dressing Yourself," email to Silliman College (Yale) students on Halloween costumes. *FIRE*. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/email-from-erika-christakis-dressing-yourself-email-to-silliman-college-yale-students-on-halloween-costumes>

Chapter 11: The Quest for Justice

1. Rawls (1971), p. 3. Rawls was one of the leading political philosophers of the twentieth century, famous for asking what kind of society we would design if we had to do it from behind a "veil of ignorance" as to what role we would occupy in the society.

2. Data from Ghitza & Gelman (2014) is made interactive in Cox, A. (2014, July 7). How birth year influences political views. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2014/07/08/upshot/how-the-year-you-were-born-influences-your-politics.html?_r=0

3. The year 1965 saw the passage of the Voting Rights Act, the Watts riot, the march on Selma, and an increase in protests of the Vietnam War as America's involvement intensified; 1972 saw the reelection of Richard Nixon over the "peace candidate," George McGovern, in a landslide—a crushing blow to many in the counterculture. Most Americans born in 1954 could vote in that election; nobody born in 1955 was eligible.

4. Ghitza & Gelman (2014). The paper uses presidential approval ratings as an easily available proxy for the political events occurring in each year—if the president is wildly popular during your late teens (and you're white), you're more likely to vote for that party for the rest of your life. But the authors acknowledge that a variety of "political shocks" are likely to have effects; for example, assassinations, riots, and so on. The model is more descriptive of white voters than it is of black or Hispanic voters.

5. Pyramid Film Producers (Producer). (1969). The World of '68 [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://archive.org/details/worldof68>
6. Sloane, Baillargeon, and Premack (2012) found that twenty-one-month-old infants looked longer at these violations of proportionality than at scenes where only the person who worked was rewarded. See review of the literature on the early emergence of fairness in Bloom (2014).
7. Damon (1979); Kanngiesser & Warneken (2012).
8. Almas, Cappelen, Sorensen, & Tungodden (2010).
9. Starmans, Sheskin, & Bloom (2017).
10. See Adams (1963); Adams (1965); Huseman, Hatfield & Miles (1987); Walster, Walster, & Berscheid (1978).
11. Walster, Walster, & Berscheid (1978).
12. Ross & Sicoly (1979). See Fiske (1992) for discussion of how concerns about equality and proportionality vary across relationships and contexts.
13. Adams & Rosenbaum (1962).
14. Lind & Tyler (1988). See also: Tyler & Blader (2014). See also: earlier work by Thibaut and Walker (1975).
15. Tyler & Huo (2002).
16. There is a line of research arguing that causality sometimes runs the other way: many people want to justify the status quo, and this desire motivates them to rationalize existing injustices. See this accessible and recent overview: Jost, J. T. (2017). A theory of system justification. *American Psychological Association*. Retrieved from <http://www.apa.org/science/about/psa/2017/06/system-justification.aspx>
17. Hayek (1976); Nozick (1974).
18. This definition can no longer be found on the website of the National Association of Social Workers, but it was in use until at least August 11, 2017. It can be accessed at: NASW. (2017, August 11). *Social justice* [via web.archive.org]. Retrieved from <https://web.archive.org/web/20170811231830/https://www.socialworkers.org/pressroom/features/issue/peace.asp>
19. Putnam (2015), pp. 31–32, notes that “if forced to choose, Americans at all income levels say by nearly three to one that it is ‘more important for this country . . . to ensure everyone has a fair chance of improving their economic standing [than] to reduce inequality in America.’” The survey questions he cites come from a survey conducted in 2011 by the Pew Economic Mobility Project.
20. See research on System Justification Theory, for example, Jost, Banaji, & Nosek (2004).
21. See discussion in chapter 3, and see Crenshaw’s TED talk: TED (Producer). (2016, October). Kimberlé Crenshaw at TEDWomen 2016—The urgency of intersectionality [Video file]. Retrieved from https://www.ted.com/talks/kimberle_crenshaw_the_urgency_of_intersectionality
22. Sometimes members of the minority group are motivated to deny these injustices as well; see research on System Justification Theory, for example, Jost, Banaji, & Nosek (2004).
23. Guinier (1994).
24. Bolick, C. (1993, April 30). Clinton’s quota queens. *The Wall Street Journal*.
25. Lewis, N. A. (1993, June 4). Clinton abandons his nominee for rights post amid opposition. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.nytimes.com/1993/06/04/us/clinton-abandons-his-nominee-for-rights-post-amid-opposition.html>

26. See U.S. Dept. of Education, Office for Civil Rights. (1979, December 11). A policy interpretation: Title IX and intercollegiate athletics. Retrieved from <https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/docs/t9interp.html>
27. A 1993 federal appellate decision, *Cohen v. Brown Univ.*, would foreshadow what became the official position of the Department of Education three years later. In *Cohen*, members of the women's gymnastics and volleyball teams sued Brown after their teams were cut, allegedly for financial reasons. The court held that Brown had violated Title IX, because the percentage of varsity opportunities for women was lower than the percentage of female enrollment; that there was substantial unsatisfied interest from women to play sports; and that, to comply with Title IX, Brown must either fully accommodate the underrepresented sex or provide opportunities equal to the proportions in its enrollment. See: 991 F.2d 888, 899 (1st Cir. 1993). In other words, if the interest of the underrepresented sex cannot be fully accommodated, the overrepresented sex's opportunities must be reduced until the proportions match.
28. Effectively all but five colleges in the country. For more on "Dear Colleague" letters, see: Admin. (2013, May 28). Frequently asked questions regarding the federal "blueprint" for sexual harassment policies on campus. *FIRE*. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/frequently-asked-questions-regarding-the-federal-blueprint-for-sexual-harassment-policies-on-campus/#whatisdcl>
29. Cantú, N. V. (1996, January 16). Clarification of intercollegiate athletics policy guidance: The three-part test [Dear Colleague letters]. *U.S. Department of Education*. Retrieved from <https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/docs/clarific.html>
30. A second way to achieve compliance was to show that the school had "made progress" toward reaching the first standard. A third way was to show that the interest of the underrepresented gender had been "fully and effectively accommodated"—to show that, in practice, there weren't enough women left wanting to play a sport to field a team. These two options would seem to let schools off the hook for achieving equal outcomes, but, in practice, the only ways to satisfy these standards invited close scrutiny by the Office for Civil Rights, and one of the top goals of any compliance professional is to avoid an investigation by a government agency. The only way to definitively stave off an investigation is to satisfy the first certification method, which is what nearly all schools have chosen to do.
31. For evidence that schools were being held to the highest standard, see Thomas, K. (2011, April 25). College teams, relying on deception, undermine gender equity. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.nytimes.com/2011/04/26/sports/26titleix.html>
32. Thomas, K. (2011, May 1). Colleges cut men's programs to satisfy Title IX. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.nytimes.com/2011/05/02/sports/02gender.html>
33. Deaner, Balish & Lombardo (2016). They also report a variety of evidence that prenatal exposure to testosterone for girls correlates with later interest in sports, particularly more typically masculine sports.
34. Deaner et al. (2012).
35. Of course, a skeptic could argue that these differences were caused by differences in early-childhood socialization—for example, the fact that in toy stores, the aisles of toys for girls and boys are so different, with much less sporting equipment offered for girls. Perhaps, but efforts to change children's gendered play behavior by treating them in a gender-neutral or gender-reversed way have a poor history of success; see the sad case of David Reimer, for example, in Burkeman, O., & Younge, G. (2004, May 12). Being Brenda. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from

<https://www.theguardian.com/books/2004/may/12/scienceandnature.gender>. Toy stores seem to be responding to gendered preferences rather than causing them. And even if gendered sports preferences were caused entirely by early socialization rather than by prenatal hormones, that would not justify requiring universities to insist on equal outcomes, although it would have implications for elementary schools.

36. Thomas (2011, April 25); see n. 31.

37. Chang (2018).

38. Rivlin-Nadler, M. (2013, August 17). More buck for your bang: People who have more sex make the most money. Gawker. Retrieved from <http://gawker.com/more-bang-for-your-buck-people-who-have-more-sex-make-1159315115>

39. The actual study indicates that because “sexual activity is considered to be a barometer for health, quality of life, well-being and happiness,” and “health, cognitive and non-cognitive skills and personality are important factors that affect the wage level,” “it is unclear whether this correlation represents a causal relationship.” Drydakis, N. (2013). The effect of sexual activity on wages. IZA Discussion Paper No. 7529. Retrieved from <http://ftp.iza.org/dp7529.pdf>

40. Sue et al. (2007), p. 274, define microinvalidations as “communications that exclude, negate, or nullify the psychological thoughts, feelings, or experiential reality of a person of color.”

41. Gender differences in cognitive abilities are generally small or nonexistent. Gender differences in what people find interesting and enjoyable are often large, consistent across cultures, and related to exposure to prenatal hormones. For a summary of research on gender differences related to occupational choice, see Stevens, S., & Haidt, J. (2017). The Google memo: What does the research say about gender differences? *Heterodox Academy*. Retrieved from <https://heterodoxacademy.org/the-google-memo-what-does-the-research-say-about-gender-differences>

42. Tetlock, Kristel, Elson, Green, & Lerner (2000).

43. See Nordhaus, T., & Shellenberger, M. (2013, Winter). Wicked polarization: How prosperity, democracy, and experts divided America. *The Breakthrough Institute*. Retrieved from <https://thebreakthrough.org/index.php/journal/past-issues/issue-3/wicked-polarization>

Chapter 12: Wiser Kids

1. Stevens, S., & Haidt, J. (2018, March 19). The skeptics are wrong: Attitudes about free speech are changing on campus. *Heterodox Academy*. Retrieved from

<https://heterodoxacademy.org/skeptics-are-wrong-about-campus-speech>

2. Diamond, A. (2016, November 17). South Korea’s testing fixation. *The Atlantic*. Retrieved from <https://www.theatlantic.com/education/archive/2016/11/south-korean-seniors-have-been-preparing-for-today-since-kindergarten/508031>

3. Diebelius, G. (2018, February 27). Head teacher bans children from touching snow for “health and safety” reasons. *Metro News*. Retrieved from <http://metro.co.uk/2018/02/27/head-teacher-bans-children-touching-snow-health-safety-reasons-7345840>

4. We recognize that some children are targets of true bullying, and adults should neither ignore nor minimize behavior that falls under the definition of bullying. “The widely accepted definition of bullying involves three criteria: 1) Repetition: a child is the target of a pattern of aggressive behavior, or a child engages in a pattern of aggressive behaviors against others. 2) A power imbalance exists between the children involved (the child with more power is aggressive against the child with less power). 3) The aggressive child intends to do the other child or children harm.” Paresky, P. (2016). We’re giving bullying a bad name. *Psychology Today*. Retrieved

from <https://www.psychologytoday.com/blog/happiness-and-the-pursuit-leadership/201604/we-re-giving-bullying-bad-name>

5. Play:groundNYC: built for children, by children. (n.d.). Retrieved from <https://play-ground.nyc>. For a brief history of adventure playgrounds, visit <https://play-ground.nyc/history>.

To see a video about this kind of playground, visit

https://www.youtube.com/watch?time_continue=1&v=74vOpkEin_A

6. Daniel Shuchman is also the chairman of the board of FIRE.

7. “Let Grow License.” Available at www.LetGrow.org/LetGrowLicense

8. Of course, the nature of an “abuse of authority” is that it exceeds what is legally allowed; accordingly, we cannot guarantee that someone won’t detain your child. Forming an advocacy group of like-minded parents, and approaching local law enforcement to educate them before there’s a dispute may help avoid conflict. Additionally, this is not legal advice; it’s parenting advice. You should consult a licensed attorney in your state/province/country for legal advice.

9. E. Christakis (personal communication, February 18, 2018).

10. Grant, A. (2017, November 4). Kids, would you please start fighting? *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/11/04/opinion/sunday/kids-would-you-please-start-fighting.html>

11. The American Institute for Cognitive Therapy: <https://www.cognitivetherapynyc.com>

12. R. Leahy (personal communication, January 23, 2017).

13. Chansky (2004).

14. Beck Institute: <https://beckinstitute.org>. Other CBT resources include David Burns’s classic books *Feeling Good: The New Mood Therapy* (1980) and *The Feeling Good Handbook* (1999).

15. Leahy, R. (n.d.). Anxiety files. Psychology Today. Retrieved from

<https://www.psychologytoday.com/blog/anxiety-files>

16. PTSD: National Center for PTSD. (n.d.). U.S. Department of Veterans Affairs. Retrieved from https://www.ptsd.va.gov/public/materials/apps/cpt_mobileapp_public.asp

17. AnxietyCoach. (n.d.). *Mayo Clinic*. Retrieved from

<https://itunes.apple.com/us/app/anxietycoach/id565943257?mt=8>. For more information on CBT apps, see ADAA-reviewed mental health apps at <https://adaa.org/finding-help/mobile-apps>

18. Mindful Staff (2017, January 11). Jon Kabat-Zinn: Defining mindfulness. *Mindful*. Retrieved from <https://www.mindful.org/jon-kabat-zinn-defining-mindfulness>

19. Mindful Schools. (n.d.). Research on mindfulness. Retrieved from

<https://www.mindfulschools.org/about-mindfulness/research>. School-based mindfulness

programs are also beneficial. See: Ohio Mental Health Network, Project Aware Information

Brief. (n.d.). School-based mindfulness interventions. Retrieved from

http://resources.oberlinkconsulting.com/uploads/infobriefs/Final_Mindfulness_Brief_No_3.pdf

20. Rempel, K. (2012).

21. Gelles, D. (n.d.). Mindfulness for children. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from

<https://www.nytimes.com/guides/well/mindfulness-for-children>

22. Emory-Tibet Partnership (n.d.). CBCT. Retrieved from <https://tibet.emory.edu/cognitively-based-compassion-training>. And for a program at the University of Massachusetts Medical

School that combines CBT with mindfulness (Mindfulness-Based Cognitive Therapy), see:

Center for Mindfulness. (n.d.). A mindful way through depression. MBCT: Mindfulness-based cognitive therapy. Retrieved from <https://www.umassmed.edu/cfm/mindfulness-based-programs/mbct-courses>

23. Solzhenitsyn (1975).

24. TED (Producer). (2011, April 26). On being wrong—Kathryn Schulz [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QleRgTBMX88>
25. We expect that we will have gotten some things wrong in this book, and we will maintain a page of corrections at TheCoddling.com, where we will thank critics for pointing out our mistakes.
26. H. Cooper (personal communication, February 27, 2018). Also see: Cooper, Civey Robinson, & Patall (2006).
27. SBS Dateline (Producer). (2014, October 21). No rules school [Video File]. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=r1Y0cuufVGI>
28. This can work before school begins in the morning, too. For more information, see Let Grow. (2017, March 4). Let Grow Play Club Final [Video file]. Retrieved from <https://youtu.be/JX2ZG0b9I-U>. The seven schools in the Patchogue-Medford school district on Long Island, NY, have been piloting the Let Grow Play Club, which involves almost no adult interference. Lori Koerner, principal at the Tremont Elementary School there, says, “This may have been one of the most amazing experiences in my 28 years in education.” She adds that she saw “No bullying . . . It’s almost like they don’t argue, because they know there’s nobody that’s gonna jump in and help them solve the problem, so they have to just get along.” See: News Desk. (2018, January 25). Pat-Med debuts before school play program. *Patchogue Patch*. Retrieved from <https://patch.com/new-york/patchogue/pat-med-debuts-school-play-program>
29. One option is to have kids keep their phones zipped in a lockable cell phone pouch, which performing artists like comedian Dave Chappelle are beginning to require at their shows. The pouches are distributed upon entry, phones are locked inside, and while everyone still has his or her phone, they are unusable until tapped on an unlocking device and retrieved from the pouch. See, for example, Yondr. (n.d.). How it works. Retrieved from <https://www.veryondr.com/howitworks>
30. American Academy of Pediatrics Policy Statement. (2013). The crucial role of recess in school. Retrieved from <http://pediatrics.aappublications.org/content/pediatrics/early/2012/12/25/peds.2012-2993.full.pdf>
31. Intellectual Virtues Academy: <http://www.ivalongbeach.org>
32. You can read book reviews, articles, and chapters of Professor Baehr’s books by going to his website: <https://jasonbaehr.wordpress.com/research>. There you can also download Educating for Intellectual Virtues: An Introductory Guide for College and University Instructors: https://jasonbaehr.files.wordpress.com/2013/12/e4iv_baehr.pdf
33. International Debate Education Association: <https://idebate.org/start-debate-club>
34. Intelligence Squared debates are found at <https://www.intelligencesquaredus.org/debates>
35. Reeves, Haidt, & Cicirelli (2018). The book is titled All Minus One: John Stuart Mill’s Ideas on Free Speech Illustrated. A free version of the e-book can be downloaded from HeterodoxAcademy.org/mill
36. Available at OpenMindPlatform.org
37. Common Sense Media’s research is available at <https://www.common Sense Media.org/research>
38. Clark, Algae, & Green (2018).
39. The nonprofit organizations Common Sense Media and the Center for Humane Technology are working together to shift how technology affects the mind. You can find suggestions for how to reduce the negative effects of smartphone use here: <http://humanetech.com/take-control>

40. In general, we oppose overmanaging and over-monitoring kids. But in this case, given the sophistication of the social media companies in manipulating users and given the high levels of self-reported device addiction among teens and the possible links to depression and suicide, we think that the use of external constraints and parental monitoring is appropriate.
41. People report lower levels of empathy toward conversation partners in the presence of a mobile device. See: Misra, Cheng, Genevie, & Yuan, M. (2014). See also: Nauert, R. (2017, May 25). Parents' digital distractions linked to kids' behavioral issues. *Psych Central*. Retrieved from <https://psychcentral.com/news/2017/05/25/parents-digital-distractions-linked-to-kids-behavioral-issues/121061.html>
42. "Regularly sleeping fewer than the number of recommended hours is associated with attention, behavior, and learning problems. Insufficient sleep also increases the risk of accidents, injuries, hypertension, obesity, diabetes, and depression. Insufficient sleep in teenagers is associated with increased risk of self-harm, suicidal thoughts, and suicide attempts." Paruthi, S., et al. (2016). Recommended amount of sleep for pediatric populations: A consensus statement of the American Academy of Sleep Medicine. *Journal of Clinical Sleep Medicine*, 12(6): 785–786. Retrieved from <https://aasm.org/resources/pdf/pediatricsleepdurationconsensus.pdf>
43. Stanford Medicine News Center. (2015, October 8). Among teens, sleep deprivation an epidemic. Retrieved from <https://med.stanford.edu/news/all-news/2015/10/among-teens-sleep-deprivation-an-epidemic.html>. See also: Twenge (2017), chapter 4.
44. Twenge (2017). Also, in *Reclaiming Conversation* (2015) by MIT professor Sherry Turkle, Turkle reports that one middle school dean told her, "Twelve-year-olds play on the playground like eight-year-olds," (p. 3). Turkle notes that children are delayed in their ability to read others' emotions, their friendships are superficial, and there has been a general decline in empathy among college students. See also: Turkle, S. (2015, September 26). Stop Googling. Let's talk. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2015/09/27/opinion/sunday/stop-googling-lets-talk.html>
45. Arnett (2004) wrote about "emerging adulthood" as a new phase of life in the late teens and early twenties, as marriage and parenthood started to arrive later and later in the postwar decades.
46. Dunn, L. (2017, April 24). Why your brain would love it if you took a gap year. *Forbes*. Retrieved from <https://www.forbes.com/sites/noodleeducation/2017/04/24/why-your-brain-would-love-it-if-you-took-a-gap-year/#7d59496e41e2>. See also: Southwick, N. (2014, December 2). What do college admissions really think of your gap year? Retrieved from <https://www.gooverseas.com/blog/what-do-college-admissions-really-think-of-your-gap-year>
47. Aspen Ideas. (n.d.). A civic rite of passage: The case for national service. Retrieved from <https://www.aspenideas.org/session/civic-rite-passage-case-national-service>
48. Service Year Alliance. (n.d.). What we do. Retrieved from http://about.serviceyear.org/what_we_do
49. McChrystal, S. (2014, November 14). How a national service year can repair America. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/mcchrystal-americans-face-a-gap-of-shared-experience-and-common-purpose/2014/11/14/a51ad4fa-6b6a-11e4-a31c-77759fc1eacc_story.html
50. Learn more about gap years at <https://www.GapYearAssociation.org>
51. Varadarajan, T. (2018, February 16). The free-speech university. *The Wall Street Journal*. Retrieved from <https://www.wsj.com/articles/the-free-speech-university-1518824261>

Chapter 13: Wiser Universities

1. To list just a few others, giving only the English translations: Brandeis University: “Truth, even unto its innermost parts”; California Institute of Technology and Johns Hopkins University: “The truth shall make you free”; Colgate University: “For God and Truth”; Howard University: “Truth and Service”; Northwestern University: “Whatsoever things are true”; University of Michigan: “Art, Science, Truth.”
2. Pew Research Center. (2017, July 10). Sharp partisan divisions in views of national institutions: Republicans increasingly say colleges have negative impact on U.S. U.S. Politics and Policy. Retrieved from <http://www.people-press.org/2017/07/10/sharp-partisan-divisions-in-views-of-national-institutions>
3. Marx wrote this line in 1845, in his Theses on Feuerbach, which was published as an appendix to Engels (1888/1976). The quoted line is on p. 65. It is also engraved in English on his tomb, in London.
4. As we showed in chapter 5, The Evergreen State College changed its mission statement in 2011 to include the phrase “Evergreen supports and benefits from a local and global commitment to social justice . . .” Brown University has considered a similar move, as can be seen in this documentary: Montz, R. (2016). Silence U: Is the university killing free speech and open debate? We the internet documentary. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=x5uaVFfX3AQ>. After the president spoke of Brown’s “bedrock commitment to social justice and equity,” a group of faculty members wrote, “We applaud and are hopeful about the call of the president and provost to unite around a University agenda of social justice.” Brown Faculty Members (2015, November 13). Brown faculty members: Supporting students of color in changing Brown. *The Brown Daily Herald*. Retrieved from <http://www.browndailyherald.com/2015/11/13/brown-faculty-members-supporting-students-of-color-in-changing-brown>
5. Dreger (2015), p. 262.
6. Dreger (2015), p. 262.
7. A good deal of this language often comes from the American Association of University Professors (AAUP), which was founded in 1915 to fight for academic freedom on campus. The AAUP’s statements from 1915 and 1940 are well thought out and inspirational commitments to academic freedom and free inquiry, and later statements by the AAUP on student speech and “extramural” speech (when a professor speaks off campus) also do an excellent job. AAUP. (1940). Statement of principles on academic freedom and tenure. Retrieved from <https://www.aaup.org/report/1940-statement-principles-academic-freedom-and-tenure>. See also: AAUP. (1915). Declaration of principles on academic freedom and tenure. Retrieved from <https://www.aaup.org/NR/rdonlyres/A6520A9D-0A9A-47B3-B550-C006B5B224E7/0/1915Declaration.pdf>
8. FIRE. (n.d.). Adopting the Chicago Statement. Retrieved from <https://www.thefire.org/student-network/take-action/adopting-the-chicago-statement>
9. You can find the policies of more than 450 colleges and universities at www.thefire.org. Universities can join the growing number of colleges whose policies earn a “green light” rating from FIRE, which usually produces positive publicity for a university. As of the final draft of this manuscript, forty colleges and universities have received a green light rating. You can see which colleges are rated as red, yellow, or green at <https://www.thefire.org/spotlight/using-the-spotlight-database>

10. You can find some information on each school's openness to viewpoint diversity, including its response to recent speech disruptions, by consulting the Heterodox Academy Guide to Colleges, available at <http://heterodoxacademy.org/guide-to-colleges>
11. Arnett, J. J. (2004).
12. Professors and deans can use the Campus Expression Survey, a free tool created by Heterodox Academy, to measure the speech climate on campus. Available at <http://heterodoxacademy.org/campus-expression-survey>
13. Simmons, R. J. (2014, May 18). Commencement address, Smith College. Retrieved from <https://www.smith.edu/about-smith/smith-history/commencement-speakers/2014>. Simmons was chosen as the substitute commencement speaker after Christine Lagarde, former managing director of the International Monetary Fund, withdrew in response to student protests.
14. This distinction could have been made clearer in the much-discussed 2016 letter sent to University of Chicago incoming freshmen by Dean of Students Jay Ellison. It read in part, “[W]e do not condone the creation of intellectual ‘safe spaces’ where individuals can retreat from ideas and perspectives at odds with their own.” You can read the dean’s entire letter here: https://news.uchicago.edu/sites/default/files/attachments/Dear_Class_of_2020_Students.pdf
15. Haidt, J. (2017, March 2). Van Jones’ excellent metaphors about the dangers of ideological safety [Blog post]. Heterodox Academy. Retrieved from <https://heterodoxacademy.org/2017/03/02/van-jones-excellent-metaphors>
16. See, for example, Sidanius, Van Laar, Levin, & Sinclair (2004), which found a variety of negative effects (including decreased feeling of common identity and increased feelings of ethnic victimization) from participation in “ethnic enclaves” in college. Effects were similar for minority students, and for white students in fraternities.
17. Murray, P. (1945). An American Credo. *CommonGround*, 5 no.2 (1945): 24. Retrieved from <http://www.unz2.com/print/CommonGround-1945q4-00022>
18. See BridgeUSA.org, and see a profile of the group in: Khadaroo, S. T. (2017, October 26). The anti-Washington: College group offers a model for debating politely. *The Christian Science Monitor*. Retrieved from <https://www.csmonitor.com/EqualEd/2017/1026/The-anti-Washington-College-group-offers-a-model-for-debating-politely>

Conclusion: Wiser Societies

1. Thomas Babington Macauley. From his book review on Southey’s *Colloquies on Society*, published in the *Edinburgh Review* in January 1830. Retrieved from <http://www.econlib.org/library/Essays/macS1.html>
2. Facebook says it is now trying to foster more “meaningful interactions”; see Vogelstein, F. (2018, January 11). Facebook Tweaks Newsfeed to Favor Content From Friends, Family. *Wired*. Retrieved from <https://www.wired.com/story/facebook-tweaks-newsfeed-to-favor-content-from-friends-family>
3. Tsukayama, H. (2018, March 1). Twitter’s asking for help on how to be less toxic. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/the-switch/wp/2018/03/01/twitters-asking-for-help-on-how-to-be-less-toxic/?utm_term=.4b28ef8a631b. See especially this post by researchers working with Twitter: Measuring the health of our public conversations. (2018, March 1). *Cortico*. Retrieved from <https://www.cortico.ai/blog/2018/2/29/public-sphere-health-indicators>

4. Common Sense Media. (2018, February 5). Common Sense partners with the Center for Humane Technology; Announces “Truth About Tech” Campaign in response to escalating concerns about digital addiction. Retrieved from <https://www.commonsensemedia.org/about-us/news/press-releases/common-sense-partners-with-the-center-for-humane-technology-announces>
5. De la Cruz, D. (2018, March 29). Utah passes “free-range” parenting law. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/03/29/well/family/utah-passes-free-range-parenting-law.html>
6. See: Illing, S. (2017, December 19). Reciprocal rage: Why Islamist extremists and the far right. *Vox*. Retrieved from <https://www.vox.com/world/2017/12/19/16764046/islam-terrorism-far-right-extremism-isis>
7. See: Illing, S. (2017, October 13). 20 of America’s top political scientists gathered to discuss our democracy. They’re scared. Retrieved from <https://www.vox.com/2017/10/13/16431502/america-democracy-decline-liberalism>
8. See: Chua (2018).
9. See: Rauch, J. (2017, November 9). Speaking as a *The New York Review of Books*. Retrieved from <http://www.nybooks.com/articles/2017/11/09/mark-lilla-liberal-speaking>
10. Rauch, J. (2018, February 16). Have our tribes become more important than our country? *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/outlook/have-our-tribes-become-more-important-than-our-country/2018/02/16/2f8ef9b2-083a-11e8-b48c-b07fea957bd5_story.html
11. @DalaiLama. (2018, May 21). [Tweet]. Retrieved from <https://twitter.com/DalaiLama/status/998497410199437312>
12. Klein, A. (2010, April 26). Not cool: The U of C tops HuffPo’s anti-party list. *The Chicago Maroon*. Retrieved from <https://www.chicagomaroon.com/2010/04/26/not-cool-the-u-of-c-tops-huffpo-s-anti-party-list>
13. Franklin, B. (1750). Available at <https://founders.archives.gov/documents/Franklin/01-04-02-0009>

Appendix 1: How to Do CBT

1. For a review of self-help books for depression, see Anderson et al. (2005).

Appendix 2: The Chicago Statement on Principles of Free Expression

1. You can read the committee’s report here:
<https://freeexpression.uchicago.edu/sites/freeexpression.uchicago.edu/files/FOECommitteeReport.pdf>